UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

Investigation of:

M/V COSCO BUSAN/BRIDGE ALLISION *

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA * Docket No.: DCA-08-MM-004

*

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

Interview of: HONG ZHI WANG, THIRD MATE

Le Meridian Hotel 333 Battery Street San Francisco, CA 94102

Wednesday, December 3, 2008

The above-captioned matter convened, pursuant to notice at 8:00 a.m.

BEFORE: ROBERT V. COMBS

APPEARANCES:

ROBERT V. COMBS
Assistant General Counsel
Office of General Counsel
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.
Washington, D.C 20594
(202) 314-6446

CAPT. ROB JONES
Marine Accident Investigator
Master Mariner
Office of Marine Safety
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20594
(202) 314-6458

ROBERT W. HENRY
Chief Marine Investigation Division
MS-10, Room 6314
490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20594
(202) 314-6490

BARRY STRAUCH, Ph.D. Chief, Marine Investigation Division Office of Marine Safety 490 L'Enfant Plaza East, S.W. Washington, D.C. 20594 (202) 314-6503

Department of Fish and Game Office of Spill Prevention and Response 425 Executive Court North

Fairfield, CA 94534

(707) 804-4902

RICK HOLLY

CAPT. STEVE BROWN
American Pilots Association
499 South Capitol Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20594
(202) 484-0700

APPEARANCES (Continued)

CAPT. PATRICK A. MOLONEY
Executive Director
State of California
Board of Pilot Commissioners for the
Bays of San Francisco
San Pablo and Suisun
Pier 9, Suite 102
San Francisco, CA 94111
(415) 397-2255

CAPT. RICHARD A. HURT
San Francisco Bar Pilots
Commissioned Pilot for Stockton
And Sacramento
Unit 34
Pier 9 East End
San Francisco, CA 94111
(415) 362-5436

CAPT. G. ROSS WHEATLEY (USCG-Ret) Senior Investigating Officer Sector San Francisco Coast Guard Island, Building 14 Alameda, CA 94501 (510) 437-3146

JOHN F. MEADOWS Hoagland, Longo, Moran, Dunst and Doukas 333 Pine Street 5th Floor San Francisco, CA 94104 (415) 781-7050

MARC R. GREENBERG Keesal, Young and Logan 400 Ocean Gate Long Beach, CA 90801 (562) 436-7416

JONATHAN R. HOWDEN Winston and Strawn 101 California Street San Francisco, CA 94111 (415) 591-1439

Free State Reporting, Inc. (410) 974-0947

APPEARANCES (Continued)

CAPT. AGA NAGARAJAN

MARK CONRAD Munger, Halls, and Olsen

I N D E X

ITEM		PAGE
Interview	of Third Mate Hong Zhi Wang:	
	By Mr. Jones	10
	By Mr. Henry	33
	By Mr. Strauch	44
	By Capt. Holly	59
	By Capt. Brown	67
	By Capt. Moloney	69
	By Capt. Hurt	71
	By Mr. Wheatley	73
	By Capt. Aga	75
	By Mr. Jones	81
	By MR. Henry	86
	BY Mr. Strauch	90
	By Capt. Holly	94
	By Capt. Brown	94
	By Capt. Moloney	96
	By Capt. Hurt	98
	By Capt. Aga	99

E X H I B I T S

EXHIBIT NUMBER	MARKED	RECEIVED
NTSB		
NTSB-2	22	
NTSB-8	17	
NTSB-9	15	
NTSB-11	80	

1	I	N	Т	Ε	R	V	I	ΕW	

- 2 (Time Noted: 8:00 a.m.)
- 3 (Whereupon,
- 4 HONG ZHI WANG
- 5 was called as a witness and, after having been first duly sworn,
- 6 was examined and testified as follows:)
- 7 COURT REPORTER: Please state your full name for the
- 8 record and the spelling of your full name for the record.
- 9 THE WITNESS: Hong Zhi Wang.
- 10 COURT REPORTER: Okay, sir?
- THE WITNESS: H-O-N-G, Z-H-I, W-A-N-G.
- 12 COURT REPORTER: Okay, sir, you can put your hand down.
- 13 (Whereupon,
- 14 KENNETH KWAN
- 15 having been duly sworn to faithfully and accurately interpret the
- 16 questions propounded to and the answers given by HONG ZHI WANG,
- 17 interpreted as follows:)
- 18 COURT REPORTER: You may proceed.
- MR. COMBS: Okay, I'm going to go over the ground rules,
- 20 again, because we do have some new people, but just to reiterate
- 21 them for the people who are here as well.
- Okay, only the party representatives may participate,
- 23 that is, speak and ask questions. The other people are here only
- 24 as observers and are not allowed to speak.
- This is being tape-recorded; it is being transcribed and

- 1 it is an official National Transportation Safety Board interview.
- 2 There will be no objections to any questions. There are
- 3 no interruptions. Each party representative will get an
- 4 opportunity to ask questions twice. We'll go around twice, but
- 5 we'll start of with NTSB staff asking questions and then each
- 6 party will be able to ask questions and then we'll go around
- 7 again.
- Before you speak, please state your name so that it'll
- 9 be clear on the record who's speaking. And I'll go ahead and
- 10 relate this too. We're prepared to go to a Board meeting in this
- 11 matter on January the 6th.
- 12 At this time, you should turn off all cell phones and
- 13 pagers. If you want to put it on vibrate, that's fine, but please
- 14 don't be getting up and leaving to talk on the phone, because that
- 15 leads to disruptions.
- 16 And the order of questions, again, we'll start with
- 17 Rob Jones, Rob Henry, Barry Strauch, and then continue around the
- 18 table.
- 19 And let's go ahead and introduce ourselves around the
- 20 room, for the benefit of those who are new and for Mr. Wang.
- Okay, my name is Robert V. Combs, I'm in the Office of
- 22 General Counsel at the National Transportation Safety Board.
- MR. HENRY: Robert Henry, Office of Marine Safety, NTSB.
- 24 CAPT. JONES: Rob Jones, I'm a Marine Investigator with
- 25 the NTSB.

- 1 MR. WHEATLEY: Ross Wheatley, Chief of Coast Guard
- 2 Investigations, Sector San Francisco.
- 3 CAPT. HURT: Rich Hurt, San Francisco Bar Pilots.
- 4 CAPT. MOLONEY: Patrick Moloney, Pilot Commission.
- 5 MR. GETZ: Brian Getz, the attorney for Mr. Wang, the
- 6 witness.
- 7 THE INTERPRETER: Kenneth Kwan, the interpreter.
- 8 CAPT. BROWN: Steve Brown of the American Pilots
- 9 Association.
- MR. GREENBERG: Marc Greenberg, Keesal, Young and Logan,
- 11 along with Al Peacock (ph.) and we have Captain Aga Nagarajan on
- 12 the --
- 13 CAPT. HOLLY: Rick Holly, Department of Fish and Game,
- 14 Office of Spill Prevention and Response.
- 15 MR. STRAUCH: I'm Barry Strauch with the National
- 16 Transportation Safety Board, Office of Marine Safety.
- MR. COMBS: Mr. Meadows?
- 18 MR. MEADOWS: Yes, John Meadows, representing
- 19 Captain Cota.
- 20 CAPT. COTA: Captain Cota.
- MR. CONRAD: Mark Conrad, attorney with Munger, Halls
- 22 and Olsen, representing Sperry Marine.
- MR. PAETZOLD: Ray Paetzold, counsel for the Board of
- 24 Pilot Commissioners.
- MS. QUIROZ: Claudia Quiroz -- representing Captain

- 1 Cota.
- 2 MR. COMBS: Okay, thank you. We'll turn the first set
- 3 of questions over to Captain Jones.
- 4 INTERVIEW OF THIRD MATE HONG ZHI WANG
- 5 BY CAPT. JONES:
- 6 Q. Sir, do you go by Hong or Wang?
- 7 A. Wang is the family name.
- Q. Okay. All right, Mr. Wang, let's just start out with
- 9 the day of the accident, November 7th. When did you first get
- 10 called?
- 11 A. Around 5:45 a.m.
- 12 Q. Okay. And then, what did you start with your duties?
- 13 A. And then I will exchange a few words with the second
- 14 officer, in regard to change of shift.
- 15 Q. Okay. And where did this take place and did you report
- 16 up to the bridge?
- 17 A. I'm not sure if I exchanged a few words with the second
- 18 officer or whether it's on deck or on the bridge.
- 19 Q. Okay. And what were your duties that morning, in
- 20 preparation for departing?
- 21 A. In order to prepare for set sail, I went up to the
- 22 bridge and checked the equipment on the bridge.
- Q. Okay. Did you turn on the equipment on the bridge?
- A. Yes, some of the equipment was turned on by the second
- 25 officer when he was on watch and I turned on some.

- 1 Q. Okay. What did you turn on?
- 2 A. I turned on the standby mode for the engine room, as
- 3 well as turn on the -- some type of recorder. And then, also, I
- 4 have to turn on the VHF radio.
- 5 Q. Okay. How about the radars?
- 6 A. I remember that I went up to the bridge. The radar was
- 7 turned on by the second officer.
- 8 Q. Okay. Did you tune -- adjust the radars the way you
- 9 like them?
- 10 A. Yes, I did tune a little bit.
- 11 Q. Okay. Did you conduct a gear test of all the equipment
- 12 one hour prior to sailing?
- 13 A. Would you say it again, please?
- Q. A gear test, the engines full ahead, full astern, adjust
- 15 the bells, communications, telephone, the whistle, general alarm.
- 16 A. Yes, I did.
- 17 Q. To your knowledge, was everything working on the bridge,
- 18 that needed to be, prior to sailing that morning?
- 19 A. Yes, according to my judgment, all the equipment ready.
- 20 Q. Okay. And when did the pilot come aboard?
- 21 A. I'm not clear of the exact time, but I thought it would
- 22 be around 6:20 a.m.
- Q. Now, did he come up on the bridge or, did you know, over
- 24 the radio, that he was coming from the gangway?
- 25 A. One of the crew members brought him up.

- 1 Q. Okay. Do you have a radio, handheld radio?
- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And what happened next, after the pilot came
- 4 aboard?
- 5 A. Yes, after he came on board, I gave him the pilot card.
- 6 Q. Okay. And did he look at that?
- 7 A. I thought that he had taken a look at it because there
- 8 is a space where he had to sign his name.
- 9 Q. And did he sign it?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Did you go over the pilot card with him, or did the
- 12 master?
- 13 A. Well, I just remember that when I gave the pilot card to
- 14 him, I was busy doing some other things.
- 15 Q. Okay. Did the pilot have any questions for you after
- 16 you gave him the pilot card?
- 17 A. I thought that he did not ask me any question.
- 18 Q. Okay. I'm just going to show you -- this is your bridge
- 19 checklist from your SMS, your Safety Management System, on the
- 20 date that the pilot came aboard that morning. All right.
- 21 Just -- at the bottom, is that your signature?
- 22 A. Yes, that was my signature there.
- Q. Okay. And could you look down the checkboxes and see if
- 24 all of those accomplished?
- 25 A. Some item has been completed, but some has not been --

- 1 have not been.
- Q. And which ones were not? Just for the record, they're
- 3 all checked in the affirmative, right?
- 4 A. I have to clarify that. On this list, on this checklist
- 5 here, since we are preparing for set sail and there was something
- 6 that we cannot -- we could not do it right away but, rather, we
- 7 would do it during setting sail, and there were some items that
- 8 had been done during that time and some other will be taken care
- 9 during setting sail.
- 10 Q. Okay. How about Number 2, was the pilot made aware of
- 11 his lifesaving appliance?
- 12 A. I am not sure whether he is aware of this or not, but on
- 13 the -- there was always a posting in front of the equipment and it
- 14 was clearly indicated the use of it.
- 15 Q. Okay. Well, the company has made these checklists
- 16 available to you, and why would you check that if you're not sure
- 17 of it?
- 18 A. Yes, I am aware that the checklists are supposed to be
- 19 checked and there was some other document that we have to fill out
- 20 at that same time, too, so I would say that we will have to have
- 21 time to finish checking or filling all these forms.
- 22 As I explained before, that we have around a half an
- 23 hour also to prep for set sails and we cannot possibly to check
- 24 from Item 1 to Item 10, but we would check the list and then
- 25 prepare the equipment and other things, filling out the forms as

- 1 we go.
- 2 And of course, at that time, the reason that we have to
- 3 -- not to fill out all these forms in same time, but rather, to
- 4 take priority -- to take priority to do whatever that is necessary
- 5 at that moment.
- 6 And, as I explained to you that -- we will check the
- 7 list as we are finished examining or checking of the things on the
- 8 list and when we have time, after preparing everything, we will
- 9 check the list as went by.
- 10 Q. Okay. Well -- so if I understand you right here, you're
- 11 checking off the boxes in anticipation of accomplishing the tasks
- 12 at a later time?
- 13 A. No. I don't -- I do not mean that, but rather, we have
- 14 to take priority to do whatever that is needed at that moment and
- 15 we will do things in their priority order.
- 16 Q. Okay. Was the pilot ever informed of where his
- 17 lifesaving appliance was, as number two is, between the time he
- 18 got aboard and the time of the accident -- the allision?
- 19 A. No. I did not tell him.
- 20 O. Okay. Would it be better to wait until the task is
- 21 accomplished before you checked off the box on the checklist for
- 22 preparation for getting underway?
- A. At that time, I have to prepare a lot of other things,
- 24 like preparing the telegraph, the boat thrusters, and also the
- 25 equipment on both sides of the bridge.

- 1 And then, of course, we also have to test and -- the
- 2 hams gear.
- 3 As I explained to you before that we have to put the
- 4 priority in dealing with the equipment first. For instance, the
- 5 telegraph and then the, the helmsmen wheel and the boat thrusters
- 6 and after all those then we will take care of other matters.
- 7 Q. Okay. I appreciate that you have all that other --
- 8 things to do before the ship gets underway, to make sure they are
- 9 working properly, but these checklists are also there by your
- 10 company to help you accomplish those tasks.
- So, you know, which one do you think is the priority?
- 12 A. I believe that to prepare the equipment for set sail --
- 13 for setting sail was more important at that time.
- 14 Q. Okay. I have one other checklist.
- 15 CAPT. JONES: And actually can we put that in as an
- 16 exhibit?
- 17 (Whereupon, the document referred to
- 18 as NTSB Exhibit 11 was
- 19 marked for identification.)
- 20 BY CAPT. JONES:
- Q. And, again, Mr. Wang, just verify your signature on the
- 22 bottom there.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Okay. And where -- on the Cosco Busan are there
- 25 signaling lights?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 O. And what are they used for?
- 3 A. Okay. This is for signaling during our voyage to signal
- 4 to other ships or boats, or fishing boats, around the -- in the
- 5 vicinity.
- 6 Q. And where are they located on the Cosco Busan?
- 7 A. On the port side and --
- 8 THE INTERPRETER: I just want to clarify with the
- 9 witness.
- 10 CAPT. JONES: Sure.
- 11 THE WITNESS: Okay. This light is located at the port
- 12 side -- to the printer (ph.)
- 13 BY CAPT. JONES:
- Q. Okay. And did you take those out on that morning and
- 15 test them to make sure they were working?
- 16 A. Yes. I remember that I had done so.
- 17 Q. And the same with Long Beach, leaving -- arriving and
- 18 departing Long Beach?
- 19 A. Yes. I, I thought that -- it seems I have -- it seems
- 20 that I have done so and I'm not very clear now.
- Q. Okay. That's fine. It was a long time ago.
- 22 And at the top of that checklist, the Passage Plan, the
- 23 little mark next to it --
- 24 CAPT. JONES: Can you show him that?
- 25 BY CAPT. JONES:

- 1 Q. Now, the Passage Plan that was -- it says it was signed
- 2 off by all of the officers? Did you see that Passage Plan and was
- 3 it signed by all the officers?
- 4 A. As far as I remember the Passage Plan was signed by the
- 5 master and the second officer.
- 6 Q. Okay. But, that checklist says all of the officers, all
- 7 navigating officers.
- A. I remember that there were only two space on the Passage
- 9 Plan to be signed, number one by the master. The second space was
- 10 the -- for the second officer to sign.
- 11 CAPT. JONES: Okay. And this one is another document
- 12 we'll introduce.
- 13 (Whereupon, the document referred to
- as NTSB Exhibit 8, attachment 3(b)
- 15 was marked for identification.)
- 16 BY CAPT. JONES:
- 17 Q. Is this the Passage Plan for that day, for Oakland to
- 18 Pusan?
- 19 A. It seems to be it. I am not quite clear. I do not
- 20 recall clearly.
- Q. Okay. So, just to be sure, you're not sure if that was
- 22 the Passage Plan the morning that the vessel departed on the 7th?
- 23 A. Yes. That was correct.
- Q. Okay. All right. Let's move on back to getting ready
- 25 to get underway.

- 1 CAPT. JONES: Pass those around.
- 2 BY CAPT. JONES:
- 3 Q. Now, the pilots onboard -- and you've been given the
- 4 pilot card -- did you call the master to come up and meet the
- 5 pilot?
- 6 A. Please repeat your question?
- 7 Q. Now, it's around 6:30, the pilot's onboard, you've given
- 8 him the pilot card. Did you call the master now or did the master
- 9 just come up? What happened next?
- 10 A. Yes. I called the master. If the master was not
- onboard, while the pilot came up to the bridge, then I will call
- 12 the master to meet him.
- Q. Okay. And when the master met the pilot, what happened?
- 14 A. Yes. On that morning, when the master met the pilot I
- 15 am not clear on what they were talking about, but they were -- I
- 16 heard -- I overheard something like the discussion on the
- 17 conditions to set sail.
- 18 And furthermore, there were three -- there were two
- 19 other superintendents onboard.
- 20 Q. Okay. Did the superintendent discuss the visibility,
- 21 the fog, about whether the vessel could leave or not? Did you
- 22 hear any of that?
- 23 A. No. I did not.
- Q. Okay. Did you understand what the bridge team is?
- 25 A. Yes. I remember that I have seen a booklet for bridge

- 1 team management --
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. -- on the bridge.
- 4 Q. And, getting underway that morning, who were the members
- 5 of the bridge team?
- 6 A. On the bridge there were four people: I, myself, the
- 7 captain, and the helmsman, and the pilot.
- 8 Q. Okay. And did that group of four people ever get
- 9 together around the chart and discuss how you were going to leave
- 10 the port that day?
- 11 A. I do not recall that we did that.
- 12 Q. Okay. Now, are you familiar with your Safety Management
- 13 System onboard the vessel, SMS?
- 14 A. I think that I knew something about it.
- 15 Q. Okay. Did you read it or were you allowed to read it on
- 16 the passage from Pusan to Long Beach, Long Beach to Oakland, in
- 17 those two weeks or so?
- 18 A. Yes. When I came onboard this ship, we have only --
- 19 only a very short time. The management had been changed and we
- 20 came to a new ship, new crew, a new crew. So, we have very
- 21 limited time to read all these manuals. It is different -- the
- 22 situation was different from some other ship that we came onboard.
- Q. Okay. Are you aware, in your SMS, about having a bridge
- 24 team meeting to discuss the Passage Plan before the vessel engages
- in a new route, or passage, or voyage?

- 1 A. Yes, I'm aware of the team meeting.
- Q. Okay. Did you have a team meeting leaving Long Beach?
- 3 A. I do not recall.
- 4 Q. Did you have a team meeting leaving Pusan, Korea?
- 5 A. I do not have the impression that the bridge team would
- 6 gather together for the meeting like that.
- 7 Q. Mr. Wang, was there a deck cadet aboard the Cosco Busan?
- 8 A. Yes, there were two cadets.
- 9 Q. Two cadets? One deck? One engine? Two deck?
- 10 A. Yes, one on deck and then one for the engine room.
- 11 Q. On the morning of the accident, do you know where the
- 12 deck cadet was?
- 13 A. I am not sure and I cannot say that for sure. I knew
- 14 where the cadet was.
- 15 Q. Okay.
- 16 A. It seems that one of them was in -- were in the stern.
- 17 O. I'm just worried about a deck cadet.
- 18 A. Yes, that's what I meant when I mentioned --
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. -- cadet. I meant deck cadet.
- Q. Was the deck cadet ever on the bridge with you, arriving
- 22 and departing in Long Beach or Busan?
- 23 A. I do not have the recollections that -- I don't recall
- 24 that a deck cadet would ever come on the bridge for Cosco Busan
- 25 because, basically, we only have two ports; one is Busan, the

- 1 other is Long Beach.
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. But then, in my experience with other ships, the cadet
- 4 would come to the bridge.
- 5 Q. Okay. You were on the bridge coming into San Francisco,
- 6 is that correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And do you know, going through the Oakland Bay Bridge
- 9 span, how you proceeded inbound through D and E?
- 10 A. Yes, inbound. On the 6th?
- 11 Q. Yes. He came through, you followed the chart line
- 12 inbound through the span D and E, close to the island?
- 13 A. I do not have a clear recollection.
- 0. I'll just show you a picture of the chart, and we can
- 15 make a copy of this and submit it.
- 16 So, just to describe, here's Oakland, where you were
- 17 berth outbound. And here you're coming inbound. Did you come
- 18 through D and E or over here on this side, A and B?
- 19 A. I felt that I have an impression that we have passed
- 20 through the D and E.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- 22 A. But to tell you the truth, I didn't pay much attention
- 23 on the bridge span. All I knew was that we were getting through
- 24 the bridge.
- 25 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. Yes, through two bridges.
- MR. COMBS: This is Bob Combs. We just need to clarify,
- 3 for the record, the last set of exhibits or one exhibit. Is this
- 4 one or more?
- 5 CAPT. JONES: I'm sorry, Bob. This would be one. This
- 6 subpoena is yours. So this would be one and this would be two.
- 7 (Whereupon, the document referred to
- 8 as NTSB Exhibit 2 was
- 9 marked for identification.)
- 10 BY CAPT. JONES:
- 11 Q. Okay. Now, on the morning that you left the dock in the
- 12 fog, did you know which way you were going to go through the
- 13 bridge? Were you aware of how you were going to take the vessel
- 14 out, even though you were under pilotage?
- 15 A. I'm not quite clear.
- 16 Q. All right. Let's get the vessel underway. The pilot's
- 17 on board, the master's up on the bridge with you. What are your
- 18 duties once the vessel leaves the dock?
- 19 A. Yes, my main job at that time was to operate the
- 20 telegraph, the engine telegraph, and also to operate the bow -- At
- 21 the same time, I have to monitor the helmsman's operation. And of
- 22 course, I have to take note on a log book.
- 23 O. The bow book?
- A. On the bow book.
- 25 Q. Okay. And what are you concentrating on most on a day

- 1 like that, in the fog? What's your first priority?
- 2 A. And of course, my priority at that morning, in that
- 3 condition, was to operate the engine telegraph and also to look
- 4 ahead, as well as to monitor the helmsman.
- 5 Q. Okay. And were all the orders from the pilot followed
- 6 correctly by the helmsman?
- 7 A. Yes, I thought so.
- 8 Q. And how do you know that?
- 9 A. Because I was standing beside him.
- 10 Q. Was there a rudder angle indicator?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Did you check that?
- 13 A. Yes, I did.
- 14 O. How do you verify that the engine orders the pilot gives
- 15 are being followed correctly? RPM?
- 16 A. You mean the engine order?
- 17 O. Full ahead, half ahead?
- 18 A. Yes, this is how the sequence of the orders carry [sic]
- 19 out. The pilot will give out an order, I will repeat the order,
- 20 and then clicking the control, and then I will look up to the
- 21 indicator to see if it is correct.
- 22 Q. And on that morning, were all the engine orders followed
- 23 correctly?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Now, you've been on the bridge every time the

- 1 vessel has arrived or departed a port, the Cosco Busan?
- A. Yes, that is correct. Yes, it's different in other
- 3 ships, but only on this, Cosco Busan -- that I was supposed to be
- 4 on the bridge in and out of the port.
- Okay. How about the helmsman, was it the same helmsman
- 6 each time?
- 7 A. No, there were three helmsmen.
- 8 0. Okay.
- 9 A. Of course, they have to take turns and some will be on
- 10 duty from 0000 hours to 0600 hours -- 0400. And then four to 800
- 11 hours. And then eight to 1200 hours, et cetera.
- 12 Q. Okay. Was this the first time you've been in pilotage
- 13 waters with this helmsman, or before?
- 14 A. No, it is not the first time.
- 15 Q. Were you confident --
- 16 A. It wasn't the first time.
- 17 Q. Were you confident in his steering abilities?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And when you're on the bridge with the pilot, do
- 20 you take fixes?
- 21 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Well, I asked in general, okay. Was that the response,
- 23 in general he takes fixes?
- 24 A. Can you say that --
- Q. I'll rephrase. Forget that question.

- On the morning of the accident, did you take any fixes
- 2 between leaving the berth and the allision at the -- on the
- 3 bridge?
- 4 A. I remember that I took a fix one or twice.
- 5 O. And that was before the allision?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. I just want another document. This was an
- 8 interview right after the allision and I'll just read it and you
- 9 can read it too. It says, this is a summary by the Coast Guard.
- 10 No actual fixes taken due to doing three things at once. Just --
- 11 if you could, read that and look at that and see if that -- if you
- 12 remember that? Do you remember? Did you take a fix or no?
- 13 A. I recall that I have done it once or maybe twice.
- Q. Okay. What equipment did you use to take the fix?
- 15 A. I remember around 8:00 a.m., before we -- around 8:00
- 16 a.m., I remember that I checked the electronic chart and then took
- 17 a fix on the paper chart.
- 18 Q. While the vessel was underway?
- 19 A. Yes. Yes, but I do not recall clearly, but I felt that
- 20 I have done once, at least.
- 21 Q. And again, what equipment did you use? What type of
- 22 navigation equipment did you use to take the fix, radar, GPS,
- 23 something else?
- A. Because, at that time, I have enough clear recollection
- 25 that I have taken a look at the electronic chart.

- 1 Q. So you took a look at the electronic chart and memorized
- 2 the latitude and longitude and then went back to the paper chart
- 3 and wrote down a fix?
- 4 A. Because the voyage was very short and I remember that I
- 5 took a look at the electronic chart as well as the GPS and I
- 6 compared it with the paper chart.
- 7 Q. Did you actually plot a fix with a paper and pen, on
- 8 paper and pencil?
- 9 A. I remember I did.
- 10 Q. All right, I'm just going to -- the same chart, all
- 11 right? Again, we'll submit it as evidence.
- But do you remember about where on that chart you
- 13 plotted that fix that morning? Okay, that's --
- 14 A. I think that it's roughly in this position.
- 15 Q. That's showing, just for the record, that's showing
- 16 approximately where the vessel is still at the berth. Any fixes
- 17 between departing the estuary and into the harbor, before you hit
- 18 the bridge? Any fixes in here?
- 19 A. Yes, I do take a fix prior to the allision.
- 20 Q. Okay. Well, here's the bridge and you pointed right to
- 21 the bridge. Where, prior to the allision, did you take that fix?
- 22 A. I think that this is where I plot the fix.
- Q. Right at the bridge, almost, right?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. And you plotted that on the paper chart?

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you remember what time that was?
- 3 A. Approximately 8:29, 8:30 a.m.
- 4 Q. So either at the time of the allision or one minute
- 5 before the allision?
- A. Yes, according to my memory, that it could be prior to
- 7 the allision.
- 8 Q. Okay. And when you went to take that fix, because you
- 9 were at the telegraph, did you tell the captain you were going to
- 10 do that, and where were the captain and the pilot standing at that
- 11 time?
- 12 A. Do you mean the time -- I mean the timeframe
- 13 during 8:30?
- 0. When you went to take that fix, when you plotted that
- 15 fix, you left the telegraph to go plot it on the paper chart, is
- 16 that correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And did you ask the captain or tell the captain you were
- 19 going to go get a fix right now, because now the telegraph is
- 20 unmanned.
- 21 A. As soon as I heard the bosun talk, I call on the radio,
- 22 that the bridge, the bridge. Then I ran over there in a very
- 23 quick action and sharp moment. I plotted and then come back to
- 24 the telegraph.
- 25 Q. Okay, if I can just summarize?

- 1 So the only fixes that you did were the one you showed
- 2 us in the estuary, almost at the dock, and after the bosun called
- 3 up on the radio about the bridge being in view now, that's when
- 4 you left the telegraph and put a fix on the chart, seconds before
- 5 the allision?
- 6 A. Yes, I thought that that was what I did.
- 7 Q. Okay. Okay, thanks. That morning, were you nervous
- 8 about the fog?
- 9 A. Yes, I was a little bit nervous.
- 10 Q. Did you and the helmsman talk at all about the fog? --
- 11 concern you?
- 12 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Did someone make the comment that an American ship would
- 14 not be underway in this kind of fog? Do you remember that
- 15 comment?
- 16 A. Did you say American ship?
- 17 O. Yes. Was that you or the helmsman?
- 18 A. Do you mean American ship or some ship or every ship?
- 19 Q. Because I'm not quoting right from it, let's not go
- 20 there. But you said you were concerned about the fog?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Do you feel you could go to the captain about that and
- 23 talk to him about your concern that the fog is very thick?
- 24 A. Yes, at that time, I was chit-chat [sic] with the
- 25 helmsman. The pilot and the captain were on the bridge and I

- 1 believe that they overheard us.
- Q. Did the captain say anything to you about it?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Okay. Once the vessel left the dock and started getting
- 5 out into the bay, do you remember where the captain, the master
- 6 and the pilot were, where they were standing?
- 7 A. When we first set sail, the captain and the pilot was on
- 8 the starboard side of the bridge. Yes, because our ship was on
- 9 the starboard side. And then, of course, I remember that I
- 10 transferred the bow starter from the port side to the starboard
- 11 side.
- 12 Q. Okay. Did you ever shut down the bow thruster?
- 13 A. No, we transferred.
- Q. Right. So up until the allision, the bow thruster was
- 15 on the whole time?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. Yes, I did not turn off.
- 19 Q. All right. Do you know, when the bow thruster becomes
- 20 not very useful, how much speed the ship has?
- 21 A. I just remember that the captain did not order me to
- 22 turn it off when we first set sail. I do not know if it is useful
- 23 or not, but he did not order me to turn off.
- Q. Okay. When you transferred the bow thruster to the
- 25 center position by the telegraph, so you are in front of the

- 1 telegraph and the bow thruster is to your right and the helmsman's
- 2 to your left, where were the captain and the pilot?
- 3 A. The captain and the pilot were on the outside of the
- 4 bridge.
- Q. Okay. Well, once you got out into the bay and left the
- 6 dock behind, did the captain and pilot come inside?
- 7 A. Yes, they came inside the bridge.
- 8 Q. Okay. And where did they stand then?
- 9 A. Most of the time they were on the port side, but then
- 10 sometimes they would walk around.
- 11 Q. Okay, the port side? Were they standing in front of the
- 12 radar?
- 13 A. Yes, they sometimes were in front of the radar and they
- 14 might be at the port side thruster and sometimes they walk
- 15 outside.
- 16 Q. Okay. Did you touch the radar controls at all, after
- 17 the vessel got underway?
- 18 A. Yes, I did.
- 19 Q. Okay. Were the pilot and the master there?
- 20 A. When I first touched the radar, the pilot was there and
- 21 then, after that, the captain also came in.
- 22 Q. Okay. Was this before you left the dock or after you
- 23 left the dock?
- A. Before we set sail.
- 25 Q. Okay. So, after you set sail and the vessel is picking

- 1 up speed, dead slow ahead, you leave the estuary, were you
- 2 touching the radar controls after that?
- 3 A. I don't think that I ever touched the radar during that
- 4 time, because most of the time I was standing by the telegraph.
- 5 Q. Okay. When the vessel was, again, underway, passed the
- 6 estuary, heading for the bridge in the fog, were the pilot and
- 7 master -- do you remember which radar they were standing in front
- 8 of?
- 9 MR. GREENBERG: Would you mind asking for each person,
- 10 because you keep asking about pilot and captain as if they're tied
- 11 to the hip.
- 12 CAPT. JONES: As if they are tied to the hip.
- 13 MR. GREENBERG: Yeah.
- 14 CAPT. JONES: They were standing together.
- 15 MR. GREENBERG: I don't think that's --
- 16 CAPT. JONES: Well, if he wants to, he can ask if the
- 17 captain was on one radar and the pilot was on the other, or they
- 18 were standing together.
- 19 THE WITNESS: There were two radars on board.
- 20 CAPT. JONES: Okay.
- 21 THE WITNESS: And then they were operable. So I think
- 22 that, you know, whichever radar they want to use, it was possible.
- 23 BY CAPT. JONES:
- Q. Okay, but do you specifically remember whether the pilot
- 25 was in front of one radar, the master was in front of another, or

- 1 were they both standing together looking at one?
- 2 A. I'm not quite clear. I do not remember whether they
- 3 stand to take a look at one radar or different radars at that
- 4 time.
- 5 Q. Okay, all right. And just one final question and then
- 6 we can move on. Do you know what a racon is?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. Did you see a racon on the bridge, on the Bay
- 9 Bridge, on the radar of the Cosco Busan, either coming inbound or
- 10 outbound?
- 11 A. It seems that I have seen the racon.
- 12 Q. Do you remember which day?
- 13 A. I remember that I have seen the racon on the radar
- 14 screen.
- 15 Q. Okay.
- 16 A. And I do not recall clearly which day it was, whether
- 17 were inbound or outbound.
- 18 Q. Okay. And do you know what that racon symbolizes?
- 19 A. Yes, the racon is supposed to be a device that if we
- 20 sent the wave of the radar, it will bounce back on the racon, back
- 21 to the radar and then you see the spot on the radar screen.
- 22 Q. Okay. Well, that's good. Just on the Bay Bridge,
- 23 outbound -- inbound or outbound that day, where you saw the racon,
- 24 what does it symbolize? What's the meaning of that racon? What
- 25 does it show you on your radar, in San Francisco Harbor, with the

- 1 Bay Bridge?
- 2 A. It symbolizes that -- the symbol that it gave on the
- 3 screen was different from other target. It will have a different
- 4 signal or sound on the screen and then it will send out a dot to
- 5 dot.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. Yes, section to section. And then, of course, it has a
- 8 time interval.
- 9 Q. Okay, let me just ask the question. Does it symbolize
- 10 the center of the navigable area of the Bay Bridge, of the D and E
- 11 span?
- 12 A. Yes, I think so, it would show the center. And it is a
- 13 device to -- suppose to guide the ship's voyage -- radio
- 14 navigation. And then, through it we can -- we would be able to
- 15 know the position of the racon.
- 16 CAPT. JONES: Okay, I think we've hit that enough. All
- 17 right, thanks, that's all I have right now.
- 18 MR. COMBS: Would Mr. Wang like a short five-minute
- 19 break?
- THE WITNESS: Yes, I would say that.
- 21 MR. COMBS: Five minutes.
- 22 (Off the record.)
- 23 (On the record.)
- BY MR. HENRY:
- 25 Q. Robert Henry with NTSB. Mr. Wang, how long have you

- 1 been a third mate?
- A. One year or maybe a little bit more longer [sic].
- 3 Q. From today?
- 4 A. Then I would say around two years.
- 5 Q. Two years? How long have you worked for Fleet
- 6 Management?
- 7 A. Before this ship, I worked for six months on other ships
- 8 for Fleet Management.
- 9 Q. How many other ships?
- 10 A. The total was two ships for the Fleet Management.
- 11 Q. And what was the first ship?
- 12 A. Sim (ph.) Express 1.
- Q. Was it a container ship?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Similar to the Cosco Busan?
- 16 A. It is smaller than Cosco Busan.
- 17 Q. And how much sea time did you have on this ship?
- 18 A. It seems to be six months, somewhere around there.
- 19 Q. And was he familiar with the -- Fleet Management's
- 20 safety manual, safety ISM, on that ship?
- 21 A. On that ship, sir?
- 22 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. I would say that during the six months, if I have times
- 24 with nothing to do, then I would refer to the manuals.
- 25 Q. Did he have time to look at the SMS manuals on the Cosco

- 1 Busan?
- 2 A. I would say I flipped through the pages.
- 3 Q. Can Mr. Wang tell me what his primary duties and
- 4 responsibilities are as a third mate?
- 5 A. I would say that there were two different times, the
- 6 times that when the ship was on open sea, I would do the
- 7 maintenance works on the equipment and when the ship come -- is at
- 8 a port, I would be on the bridge controlling the engine power gun
- 9 and other equipment to make sure that loading and unloading is in
- 10 safety manual.
- And of course, besides the duty that I just mentioned, I
- 12 do participate in the firefighting and as well as man overboard
- 13 drill.
- 14 And besides that, I also have to put that in -- this was
- 15 the general duties that I have to take care of.
- 16 Q. Does he have duties like safety officer, ballast control
- 17 officer, other duties like that?
- 18 A. Would you repeat your question, please?
- 19 Q. Does he have primary responsibilities as maybe the
- 20 safety officer for the safety equipment, lifesaving, firefighting
- 21 or does he have primary responsibility as the ballast control
- 22 officer in the ballast control room?
- 23 A. I am not consider [sic] as the safety office on board.
- 24 I think the safety officer should be designate to the chief
- 25 engineer and of course, the chief officer will be charging the

- 1 ballast control room.
- 2 Q. The morning of the accident when Mr. Wang reported to
- 3 the bridge, was there anybody else up there at the time?
- 4 A. There were four persons.
- 5 Q. Could he name them, please?
- A. I, myself, the captain, the pilot and the helmsman.
- 7 Q. Now, this is when he first came up to the bridge?
- 8 A. I thought that when I first came to the bridge, I was
- 9 alone. I am not quite clear now if I was alone or not or whether
- 10 the second officer was there.
- 11 Q. Did Mr. Wang obtain a weather report that morning?
- 12 A. I think that I glance at the weather report.
- 13 Q. What was the format or was there a printout or a device
- 14 that gave the weather?
- 15 A. There were three different forms that the weather
- 16 reports were. It seems to be a telegraph that I received, in the
- 17 telegraph form, and there was some Navy tech.
- 18 Q. Does he recall what the forecast was for the fog
- 19 condition?
- 20 A. As I told you, that I take a glance at it but then I did
- 21 not actually --
- Q. Does Mr. Wang know what the captain's night orders are?
- 23 A. I would have to say that I'm not sure if there was night
- 24 order on that day, but the captain came on the bridge some night,
- 25 he would write something down -- wrote the night order, and some

- 1 time he did not.
- 2 Q. For the evening of November 6th and the morning of
- 3 November 7th, did the captain write any night orders?
- 4 A. No, I do not have a clear recollection.
- 5 Q. How did Mr. Wang know what the plan was for the vessel
- 6 to depart?
- 7 A. During that time, the loading and unloading was still
- 8 ongoing. We did not know when was the time for set sail [sic].
- 9 Q. During the period that Mr. Wang was on the bridge before
- 10 the vessel departed, did either one of the Fleet Management
- 11 supervisors, superintendents, come up to the bridge?
- 12 A. I don't think so.
- Q. Did Mr. Wang have any communication with the port agent
- 14 for the vessel, the local port agent?
- 15 A. No, I don't think so.
- 16 Q. I'd like to discuss a little bit about the testing of
- 17 some of the equipment. Did Mr. Wang participate in the testing of
- 18 the steering gear?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And who participated with Mr. Wang in testing the
- 21 steering gear?
- 22 A. I was doing the testing myself, but then I believe that
- 23 the shift for the second officer ended at 0600 hours. I believe
- 24 that we were preparing for set-sails, so he could have test the
- 25 steering gear himself, too. That, I am not quite sure, but this

- 1 is what I thought.
- Q. Then I'm confused, as well. Did Mr. Wang say yes, he
- 3 did, or did not, participate in the steering gear test?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. The engine order telegraph, was that set for direct
- 6 engine control?
- 7 A. This is what happened. I will inform the engine room
- 8 and they will get the main engine ready and after they test the
- 9 main engine, they inform me and everything is ready for set sail.
- 10 Q. That did not answer my question. Was the engine order
- 11 telegraph connected directly to the engine or to an engineering
- 12 watch stander who then changed the engine speed?
- 13 A. I would say that the engine telegraph does not connect
- 14 directly to the engine room. We have to -- I have to receive the
- 15 order from the pilot and then relay that order set in the engine
- 16 telegraph and they will give out a sounds or signal to the engine
- 17 room and where the engine room engineer will set to that order.
- 18 Q. Did Mr. Wang communicate directly via telephone with the
- 19 engine room, as well?
- 20 A. There were two telephones.
- 21 Q. If we can talk about bridge communications now. What
- 22 communications was Mr. Wang -- what communications capability did
- 23 Mr. Wang have, telephone, VHF radio, cell phone, walkie-talkie?
- A. I want to verify do you mean the communication among us
- 25 in the bridge, on the bridge, or communication between me and the

- 1 engine room?
- 2 Q. Engine room, the deck, the tug, yes.
- A. Well, the communications system that I use was, in order
- 4 to contact the engine room, communicate with the engine room, I
- 5 make use of the two telephones and I have a choice either to use
- 6 Phone 1 or Phone 2. As far as the communication to the deck
- 7 personnel is concerned, I use the walkie-talkie.
- 8 Q. What communications did the master have, what types of
- 9 communications?
- 10 A. Basically, the master would have the same communication
- 11 method as I described. He can use the telephone. He also can use
- 12 the walkie-talkie.
- Q. At any time prior to the allision, did the master make
- 14 any cell phone calls?
- 15 A. No, no.
- 16 Q. Did the master make any VHF radio calls?
- 17 A. I don't think that he did.
- 18 Q. Now, let's talk about the pilot. What communication
- 19 means did the pilot have?
- 20 A. I don't know if the pilot has a walkie-talkie like ours,
- 21 but I believe that he can use the VHF and of course, we set a
- 22 separate channel or frequency for him to use the VHF.
- 23 Q. Did the pilot or the master communicate with the tugboat
- 24 Revolution?
- 25 A. I don't believe that the captain will communicate

- 1 directly to the tugboat, but I believe that the direct
- 2 communication was from the pilot to the tug.
- 3 Q. Using what communication means?
- 4 A. I do not recall clearly. He might have used his own
- 5 walkie-talkie or he might use the VHF.
- 6 Q. Did the master have a cell phone on the day of the
- 7 accident?
- 8 A. I'm not sure.
- 9 Q. Did the pilot have a cell phone on the day of the
- 10 accident?
- 11 A. Yes, he had.
- 12 Q. Does Mr. Wang recall the pilot making any cell phone
- 13 calls prior to the vessel getting underway?
- 14 A. Yes, he did.
- 15 Q. Does Mr. Wang recall if the pilot made any cell phone
- 16 calls after the allision?
- 17 A. I do not recall clearly whether he used or not.
- 18 Q. Does Mr. Wang recall the pilot using the cell phone
- 19 while the vessel was underway prior to the allision?
- 20 A. From berth to --
- Q. From the berth to bridge?
- 22 A. To bridge. Yes, he did.
- Q. How many times?
- A. I do not recall how many times.
- Q. Does he recall when the last cell phone call was?

- 1 A. I do not recall clearly because he call -- whether he --
- 2 how many times he used the cell phone.
- 3 Q. Does he recall whether these were short phone calls or
- 4 long phone calls?
- 5 A. I only recall that he had used the cell phone, but I do
- 6 not recall if he used it for a long period of time or not.
- 7 Q. Does he recall where the pilot was when he was making
- 8 these cell phone calls?
- 9 A. He could have used the cell phone inside the bridge,
- 10 otherwise I wouldn't be able to, you know, notice if he used the
- 11 phone outside the bridge or not.
- 12 Q. At any time while the vessel was underway prior to the
- 13 allision, did Mr. Wang go out on the bridge wing?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Did Mr. Wang see the tug?
- 16 A. I thought that I went outside the bridge and glance at
- 17 the tug. The reason was I thought that I'd seen the tug's name,
- 18 the name of the tug, in a log book.
- 19 Q. Did he see the tug clearly?
- 20 A. No, I don't think that I had seen the tug clearly;
- 21 therefore, I ask the pilot the names of the tug.
- 22 Q. Now, Mr. Wang testified earlier that he gave the pilot
- 23 the pilot card?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Did Mr. Wang prepare the pilot card?

- 1 A. Yes. Yes, most of the time I would --
- 2 Q. Did the pilot ask any questions about information on the
- 3 pilot card?
- 4 A. He thinks that he had not.
- 5 Q. Did the pilot give Mr. Wang any pilot information?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Did Mr. Wang assist the pilot in testing any of the
- 8 navigation equipment?
- 9 A. Yes, I remember that I showed him where the equipment
- 10 was, where the radar or hams were, and I also remember that I
- 11 assist him to tune the radar.
- 12 Q. Was the pilot satisfied with the operation of the two
- 13 radars?
- 14 A. Yes, the only things that I remember that the pilot was
- 15 unsatisfied with the radar was that the acquire of the time [sic]
- 16 -- and then, of course, he asked me to readjust the VRM.
- 17 Q. Does the pilot normally operate the controls on the
- 18 radar, such as acquiring targets and changing VRM?
- 19 A. Yes, that was his routine when the pilot came onboard,
- 20 but the reason for that was that not all ship has the same radar
- 21 system. Yes, basically the pilot would come -- came onboard and
- 22 checked the operation of the radar.
- Q. But the pilot also, when the vessel was underway,
- 24 operates the radars such as changing radar scales?
- 25 A. Yes, of course. You know, he would adjust, to his

- 1 satisfaction, the VRM.
- Q. Did the pilot ever express any dissatisfaction with the
- 3 operation of either radar prior to the allision?
- 4 A. As you know that -- as you knew that there were two
- 5 radars on board and first, we try to adjust the radar on the
- 6 left-hand side and it seems that the pilot was not satisfied with
- 7 the radar on the left-hand side because he wants some -- target on
- 8 the screen, so he come back to the one on the right and his
- 9 comment was this was better. And he make some comments on the
- 10 radars. The captain also make some comments.
- 11 At that time, when we were adjusting the radar, the
- 12 captain was there, too.
- Q. Did Mr. Wang have any difficulty with the radar he was
- 14 observing?
- 15 A. I think that it is operate-able.
- 16 Q. Did Mr. Wang demonstrate the operation of the Sperry
- 17 electronic navigation system?
- 18 A. To whom?
- 19 Q. To the pilot.
- 20 A. Would you repeat the question again, sir?
- Q. Did Mr. Wang demonstrate the operation of the Sperry
- 22 electronic navigation system to the pilot?
- 23 A. Electronic chart?
- Q. Yes, electronic chart system.
- 25 A. Yes, I did.

- 1 Q. Did the pilot have any questions about its operation?
- 2 A. I think that as far as I recall, I demonstrate the zoom
- 3 in and zoom out for the pilot to see.
- 4 Q. Did the pilot operate the electronic chart system when
- 5 the vessel was underway?
- 6 A. No, I did not pay any attention on that.
- 7 Q. Is Mr. Wang familiar with the operation of the
- 8 electronic chart system?
- 9 A. Yes, I'm familiar with the basic operation.
- 10 Q. Did Mr. Wang review the operating manuals on this system
- in the two weeks that he was on the vessel?
- 12 A. Yes, I did.
- MR. HENRY: That's all the questions I have, thank you.
- 14 BY MR. STRAUCH:
- Q. Good morning, I'm Barry Strauch from the NTSB. How old
- 16 are you, Mr. Wang?
- 17 A. Thirty-one years old.
- 18 Q. And you went to Maritime Academy?
- 19 A. Yes, I did.
- 20 O. Where?
- A. Wuhan.
- Q. When did you finish at the Maritime Academy?
- 23 A. 2001.
- Q. How long was your study there?
- 25 A. Four years.

- 1 Q. What did you do after you graduated?
- 2 A. I stay home for a while.
- 3 Q. How long?
- 4 A. More than a year.
- 5 Q. When did you first sail as third mate?
- 6 A. Officially become the third officer, approximately
- 7 September 2006.
- 8 Q. What did you do between 2002 and 2006?
- 9 A. First, I became a cadet and then I became an OC -- I'm
- 10 sorry, OS. And then half of the time, when I became an OS was on
- 11 the deck. And then half of the time I work as an apprentice for
- 12 third officer.
- And of course, I was still in the process of learning to
- 14 become a third officer.
- 15 Q. How many different companies did you work for on
- 16 different ships?
- 17 A. I work for three different companies and on five
- 18 different ships, including this.
- 19 Q. How long did you work for each company?
- 20 A. On the first ship, seven months -- let me think.
- 21 O. It doesn't have to be exact.
- 22 A. And then on the second ship, about seven to eight
- 23 months. Well, it has been a long time -- please forgive me -- and
- 24 on my record, you can see.
- 25 Q. Could you tell us how you got to be hired by Fleet

- 1 Management the first time?
- 2 A. First, they hire me through a manning company in
- 3 Beijing.
- 4 O. And then?
- 5 A. And then they call me for -- and then, of course, there
- 6 was a telephone interview.
- 7 Q. How long was the interview?
- 8 A. Approximately 20 to 30 minutes.
- 9 Q. What was discussed during the interview?
- 10 A. The conversation concerning my past experience, working
- 11 as a cadet, and what position that I held and what kind of works
- 12 that I do on board the ships. And then, of course, he asked when
- 13 would I be available for the job.
- Q. Did you work for any company between the first ship that
- 15 you worked on for Fleet Management, the Cosco Busan?
- 16 A. All together, I work for three different companies.
- 17 Q. Okay. You worked for Fleet Management on a previous
- 18 vessel, is that correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 O. And what was the vessel you worked on after that one?
- 21 A. The next one was this one.
- 22 Q. Did you have another interview before -- for the Cosco
- 23 Busan or you only had one interview with Fleet Management?
- 24 A. Since I have been working for the Fleet Management
- 25 before, so when I came, arrived at Beijing for my passport

- 1 extension, for my visa, then they would ask me a few questions,
- 2 but not --
- 3 Q. In your interview with Fleet Management, the first
- 4 interview that took 20 to 30 minutes, what language was the
- 5 interview conducted in?
- 6 A. English.
- 7 Q. Did you encounter any difficulty communicating in
- 8 English during the interview?
- 9 A. I believe that the one who talked to me during the first
- 10 interview was a Chinese nationality.
- 11 Q. And that interview was in English?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And how did they train you on the first vessel you were
- 14 on, how did Fleet Management train you?
- 15 A. Before going onboard or after?
- 16 Q. Before.
- 17 A. There was no training before going onboard.
- 18 Q. And once you got onboard?
- 19 A. When I came onboard, the first time, working for the
- 20 company, we did not change over the whole crew, but only part of
- 21 the crew.
- 22 At that time, the former third officer onboard was a
- 23 Chinese and then during the time that I came onboard, the Chinese
- 24 third officer helped me to familiarize with the equipments on
- 25 board and he also showed me the firefighting and man overboard

- 1 drilling, et cetera, for most of the day.
- Q. And how long did that training take with the other third
- 3 mate?
- 4 A. Most of the day.
- 5 Q. Okay. Now, what kind of training did you get from the
- 6 company on the Cosco Busan?
- 7 A. Before going onboard?
- Veah.
- 9 A. Before going onboard the Cosco Busan, when I was still
- 10 at the manning company in Beijing, we were to watch a video and
- 11 there were a training of some sort for most of the afternoon.
- 12 Q. What was the subject of the video?
- 13 A. The video is in regard to the onboard safety measure.
- Q. And tell me about the training that you had onboard the
- 15 Cosco Busan.
- 16 A. Yes, onboard the Cosco Busan, at that time, the whole
- 17 crew were change over and there were a lot of new things to learn
- 18 all over again and what we did was we work while we learn and then
- 19 we try to create -- and then, of course, when we first came
- 20 onboard, the ship just change ownership, so there were a lot of
- 21 other manuals that belong to the former ownership and the manual
- 22 or document was not complete as a set, but they change little by
- 23 little.
- There were so many things that need to be change, the
- 25 names of the ships we have to redo. We have to also report on the

- 1 lifesaver, the different numbers that we use.
- 2 The only training I have was a key hand over by a third
- 3 officer from the -- former third officer, and that was it and we
- 4 have to learn while we work.
- 5 O. So did anyone train you on the Cosco Busan?
- 6 A. At that time, there was a superintendent. The
- 7 superintendent was the one that we came to him for question or for
- 8 any instruction because basically, I don't even know where the
- 9 firefighting equipment was, where the fire or lifesaver or any
- 10 other equipment was because it was a different ship. And
- 11 furthermore, there is no inventory list, no checklist whatsoever
- 12 to indicate where the equipment is, so we have to find our way.
- Q. Now, the first Fleet Management vessel you were on, you
- 14 on for six months, is that correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. Were you, in that six months, sailing the whole
- 17 time or did you spend time in port, like days or weeks in port, in
- 18 that six months?
- 19 A. The route on the first ship that I was on was from China
- 20 to Southeast Asia, that area. So back and forth during that six
- 21 months we, at least, have -- at least one for the first month, we
- 22 have 20 ports, approximately 20 ports call for the first month, so
- 23 we were very busy.
- And later on, the route changed to Australia and then,
- 25 again, the route changed to Shanghai.

- Q. Was the captain the same for the whole six months?
- 2 A. They changed.
- 3 Q. In that time, did any official from Fleet Management
- 4 come on board the ship?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. How long did they stay?
- 7 A. They sent several superintendents and, among them, there
- 8 was one auditor as well, and I would say that the longest time
- 9 that a superintendent would say on board was approximately 20
- 10 days.
- 11 Q. And do you remember, could you tell us what the
- 12 superintendent did in the 20 days?
- 13 A. During the 20 days that the superintendent was on board,
- 14 the ship was an old ship and we have to change our route to
- 15 Australia, so there were a lot of equipment on board, especially
- 16 firefighting equipment, need to be updated.
- 17 Q. And what did the superintendent do in terms of updating
- 18 equipment and the route change from Australia and so on?
- 19 A. Basically, the superintendent will [sic] overall in
- 20 charge of all the maintenance, updating of the equipment on deck,
- 21 in the engine room as well as the bridge.
- 22 Q. The superintendent spent time on the bridge?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Did he observe vessel operations at that time?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. And you worked for two other companies as well, in
- 2 addition to Fleet Management?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Did they also send superintendents on board the vessels
- 5 that you were on?
- A. Well, basically, on the first two ships that I was on, I
- 7 don't know if the person that came on board was the superintendent
- 8 or someone else. He basically came on board, take a quick look,
- 9 and then left.
- 10 And then, on the third ship that I worked for, there was
- 11 a short period of time the owner of the ships went on board.
- 12 Q. How long did he stay on board?
- 13 A. Approximately 10 days, for ship repair.
- 0. So the ship wasn't moving at that time?
- 15 A. That was correct.
- 16 Q. Okay. Were you interviewed by those other two companies
- 17 as well? I mean, prior to getting the job with the other two --
- 18 I'm sorry -- with the other two companies, before getting the job,
- 19 yes.
- 20 A. Yes, there was a telephone interview with the two
- 21 companies.
- Q. With each of the two companies?
- 23 A. Yes, it seems that way.
- Q. About how long did the interviews take?
- 25 A. A very short time.

- 1 Q. Shorter than with Fleet Management?
- 2 A. Shorter.
- 3 Q. Let's talk about the day of the accident. You said you
- 4 got up at -- was it 5:15 that you got up?
- 5 A. 5:45.
- 6 Q. Okay. When did you find out you were going to depart?
- 7 A. Approximately around 6:00 a.m., when we changed ship
- 8 with second officer. That was when I learned from the second
- 9 officer.
- 10 Q. The second officer told you that you were going to
- 11 depart?
- 12 A. Yes, he told me that as soon as the loading and
- 13 unloading of the ship was complete, then we would set sail.
- Q. Okay. From the time you got up at 5:45 to the time you
- 15 learned you were going to depart, did you go outside at any time
- 16 or see what it was like outside at any time?
- 17 A. I'm not sure, but I thought that maybe I step out once.
- 18 Q. Okay. So you saw the fog?
- 19 A. Yes, but then it was still dark out there.
- 20 Q. Um-hum. Had you been in fog that thick before, when
- 21 you've departed a dock?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. This was the thickest fog you've ever seen?
- 24 A. But I have to clarify that there was one time in
- 25 Shanghai port, we were at the berth and our ship did not set out.

- 1 The fog was so dense that even the longshoreman was loading and
- 2 unloading, they couldn't even see the cargo. You know, from the
- 3 deck to the cargo area on the bottom, you cannot see.
- 4 Q. Are you describing Shanghai or Oakland?
- 5 A. Shanghai.
- 6 Q. How did this fog compare to that fog in Shanghai?
- 7 A. It would be the same.
- 8 Q. What was your reaction when you learned that the ship
- 9 was going to depart in this fog?
- 10 A. Basically, as third officer, the only thing I can do is
- 11 listen to the order.
- 12 Q. Who do you think made the decision to depart?
- 13 A. I did not know who made the decision to set sail, but I
- 14 just carry on -- carry out the order from the captain.
- 15 Q. What is your understanding as to who makes the decision
- 16 to depart in a United States port?
- 17 A. I'm not sure.
- 18 Q. Okay. You were on the bridge during the passage from
- 19 the dock to the time of the allision, is that correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Did you hear -- what kind of discussions did you hear
- 22 between the pilot and the captain?
- 23 A. Sometimes they spoke so fast that I don't understand
- 24 what they were talking about.
- Q. Could you tell us the interactions that you heard that

- 1 you did understand?
- THE INTERPRETER: I have to explain. The interpreter
- 3 have [sic] to explain -- interact with him, with the witness.
- 4 MR. STRAUCH: Talking to each other.
- 5 THE WITNESS: Yes, in what way? My impression was -- I
- 6 was stationed in the middle of the bridge and they were on the
- 7 starboard side. They seemed to be chit-chatting with each other.
- 8 BY MR. STRAUCH:
- 9 Q. Did you hear the pilot ask the captain about the meaning
- 10 of the red triangle?
- 11 A. I'm not clear if I listened to that.
- 12 Q. What was the captain doing during the passage from the
- 13 dock to the time of the allision?
- 14 A. Most of the time, during the set sail from the dock to
- 15 the allision, the captain seems to be standing side by side with
- 16 the pilot. And, first of all, before set sail, they went outside
- 17 the bridge, ordering the casting off. And when they came inside,
- 18 they seemed to be sticking -- I mean, walking with each other,
- 19 talking with each other, most of the time.
- 20 And then sometime they -- if they were not together,
- 21 then when the -- yes, when both of them were outside the bridge
- 22 and if the pilot gave any orders, the captain would repeat the
- 23 same orders so that I can hear it.
- Q. What was the captain doing during the voyage, to know
- 25 where the vessel was, to know where the vessel was going?

- 1 A. Can you repeat the question, please?
- 2 A. What was the captain doing during the voyage, to
- 3 navigate, to know where the vessel was and where the vessel was
- 4 going?
- 5 A. You know, I pay attention on -- my duty that was
- 6 operating the engine telegraph, so I didn't pay much attention on
- 7 them.
- 8 Q. Did you notice if the captain looked at the charts at
- 9 any time?
- 10 A. No, I did not pay attention.
- 11 Q. Did you notice if the captain looked at the radar at any
- 12 time?
- 13 A. The only thing that I knew was that he was standing in
- 14 front of the radar.
- 15 Q. The captain?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. I'm just going to go back to the fog that you
- 18 encountered in Shanghai. In that situation, was the port closed?
- 19 A. Oh, we were still loading and unloading, so I wasn't
- 20 sure if the harbor was closed or not.
- 21 Q. Okay. What is your understanding of what VTS does,
- 22 their role in terms of where ships go and how they proceed?
- 23 A. I believe that VTS was in control of the traffic.
- 24 Q. And is VTS in control of each vessel as well?
- 25 A. I thought that it should be the way.

- 1 Q. So it's your understanding that the VTS tells a ship
- 2 where to go?
- 3 A. I remember one incident that I encounter in one of the
- 4 ships entering the Shanghai port, and at that time, because of the
- 5 storm as well as fog, a collision, that our ship have to anchor in
- 6 one vicinity and we have to have the authorization or permission
- 7 from the VTS in order to maneuver our ship.
- At that time, there were a lot of ships go into the
- 9 harbor, but then, because of the bad weather conditions, that we
- 10 call VTS and VTS say, didn't you guys notice the weather condition
- 11 and the fog out there?
- 12 Q. What was the response?
- 13 A. And then we stopped right there, because there were so
- 14 many ships asking the same question. And then so many questions
- 15 were asked, I mean, so many same questions were asked and VTS kind
- 16 of upsetting and they say, didn't you guys see the weather
- 17 condition and the fog out there?
- 18 O. So on the Cosco Busan, when the VTS asked what the
- 19 intentions were, what was your reaction?
- 20 A. I did not notice the conversation, I mean, that segment
- 21 of the conversation.
- 22 Q. Was the SMS that you used different -- how different was
- 23 the SMS on the previous Fleet Management vessel that you worked
- on, compared to the SMS on the Cosco Busan?
- 25 A. As I explained to you earlier that we have low times to

- 1 really take a good look at the SMS on Cosco Busan. We just
- 2 skimmed the page and that's it.
- 3 Yes, basically that was, you know, if I take a good look
- 4 at it, probably I have an idea. But if I just peak at the page,
- 5 then I have no idea what's there, any difference on -- yes,
- 6 basically, on the manual, on the previous ships that I was
- 7 carefully reading it.
- And then the other manual, we just, you know, peak
- 9 through and then just take a look at the title of the manual.
- 10 That was about it.
- 11 Q. So if an SMS procedure says you're supposed to do
- 12 something, how do you do that if you haven't had a chance to look
- 13 at that procedure?
- 14 A. The manual was thick and it was for other officers' duty
- 15 as well. So what I would do was, you know, peak through the page
- 16 and then look at the section for my job duty. That was how I read
- 17 the manual.
- 18 Q. And your understanding of the procedures for you as
- 19 third mate, in the SMS, do you have to follow all of them?
- 20 A. As I explained to you that I just peak through the page,
- 21 take a glance at it, and then I have my choice to do it.
- 22 Q. What is your understanding of bridge resource
- 23 management?
- A. I'm not sure if I get the question right.
- 25 Q. BRM.

- 1 A. I have no idea.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Bridge team.
- 4 BY MR. STRAUCH:
- 5 Q. Bridge team?
- 6 A. Yes, there was a manual on that subject.
- 7 Q. Did you read that manual?
- 8 A. No, just take a quick look at it.
- 9 Q. Have you ever had any training on bridge team management
- 10 or bridge resource management, or BRM?
- 11 A. I do not receive any formal training in those subjects
- 12 on this ship.
- 13 Q. Have you had such training on other ships or in school?
- 14 A. As you know that, what we learn from school is not
- 15 actually what we do on board the ships, so there were so many
- 16 things that we had to learn.
- 17 O. Yes, we know that.
- 18 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Some things are universal.
- 19 BY MR. STRAUCH:
- Q. When a pilot is on board a vessel and you're piloting in
- 21 pilotage waters, who is in charge of the ship?
- 22 A. Well, as you know, the engine order and the helms order
- 23 were given by the pilot. So if he ordered the engine order, then
- 24 I have to carry out that order.
- 25 Q. Are there any circumstances when a pilot gives an order,

- 1 when you would not carry it out?
- 2 A. No.
- Q. And this extends whether you're operating in pilotage
- 4 waters in the United States or China or Southeast Asia, is that
- 5 the same?
- 6 A. I believe they should be the same.
- 7 Q. Are the pilots the same throughout the world?
- 8 A. Yes, that is correct.
- 9 Q. Pilots are as good in one country as they are anywhere
- 10 else?
- 11 A. It is hard to explain to you. I don't know how to
- 12 answer that question.
- MR. STRAUCH: Okay. I have no further questions.
- MR. COMBS: Can we go off the record for a minute,
- 15 please?
- 16 (Off the record.)
- 17 (On the record.)
- 18 BY CAPT. HOLLY:
- 19 Q. Mr. Wang, good afternoon. My name is Rick Holly and I
- 20 represent the Department of Fish and Game, Office of Spill
- 21 Prevention and Response. I'd like to ask you a few questions in
- 22 the context of your experience, your total experience as the third
- 23 mate. Okay.
- 24 And I'd like an estimate of how many times, in the
- 25 position of third mate, have you been on the bridge of ships in

- 1 restricted waters, and I'm looking at 50, 100, 500, just to give
- 2 me an idea?
- 3 A. The restricted water, do you mean in and out of the
- 4 port?
- 5 Q. Yes.
- 6 A. Yes, I think that we have experience many more times in
- 7 the -- working as a third officer in the other ship.
- 8 Q. Okay. Do you have a number, a rough number you can
- 9 associate with that?
- 10 A. Several times.
- 11 Q. Okay. Let me refer back to your previous testimony. I
- 12 think you said, in a ship, prior to the Cosco Busan, you had many
- 13 route changes and went to at least 20 different ports, was that
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. Could you estimate, were most of these -- the
- 17 times that you were on the bridge, was this in daylight hours
- 18 going in and out of the port?
- 19 A. I really cannot recount how many times and furthermore,
- 20 the timeframe --
- 21 O. Sure.
- 22 A. -- that you mentioned --
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. -- as third officer.
- Q. Let me try another one here. As third officer, you

- 1 mentioned, I believe, at least one other time when you were in
- 2 dense fog in Shanghai, is that correct? He was having trouble?
- 3 He was cutting in and out, so he asked if he could call in.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Okay. Were there any other times, in your recollection,
- 6 on all of the other ships, as third mate, where you've been in
- 7 reduced visibility conditions going in and out of the port?
- 8 A. Again, I have experience at least one time in and out of
- 9 the Shanghai port with the restricted visibility.
- 10 Q. Okay. During those times with restricted visibility, as
- 11 third officer, was it your responsibility to take navigational
- 12 fixes?
- 13 A. There was one time that we were out on -- before
- 14 entering the port in Shanghai and our ship was anchoring and we
- 15 were awaiting the order from VTS to allow us to get into the
- 16 harbor and at that time, we have to wait for one day and one
- 17 night.
- 18 O. Um-hum.
- 19 A. And then, of course, there were many other ships waiting
- 20 to get into the port and we had to call the VTS a lot of times to
- 21 -- because all of us were anxious to get to our berth.
- 22 And then, of course, the VTS was frustrated and since a
- 23 lot of questions were directed to them, when they can get into the
- 24 port, et cetera.
- Q. Right. But my question was did you take any

- 1 navigational fixes?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Yes.
- 4 A. Yes, we took a fix --
- Q. Okay.
- 6 A. -- in the anchorage --
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. -- while waiting.
- 9 Q. On other ships other than the Cosco Busan, how would you
- 10 normally fix the ship's position, through GPS, radar?
- 11 A. Both.
- 12 Q. Both. Could you give me your definition of a fix as
- 13 opposed to an estimated position, a navigational estimated
- 14 position?
- 15 THE INTERPRETER: Let me explain the estimate to the
- 16 witness.
- 17 THE WITNESS: First of all, in the open sea, that we
- 18 would estimate the requisition of the ships, while we are busy
- 19 doing some other things and then, later on, we will take a fix.
- 20 CAPT. HOLLY: Okay.
- 21 THE WITNESS: And then, due to other estimated data that
- 22 we -- we estimate the position of the ship in the open sea.
- BY CAPT. HOLLY:
- Q. How about in the harbor?
- 25 A. Sometimes we use the GPS and then sometimes we use the

- 1 landmark. By comparing the two landmarks, then I can always
- 2 estimate the coastline from the two landmarks, in order to find
- 3 out our ship's position. And sometimes we will estimate the
- 4 distance between the ship and the landmark.
- 5 Q. Okay. So you use two lines to fix your ship's position,
- 6 is that my understanding?
- 7 A. Yes. And sometimes we use the bearing and distance.
- 8 Q. Okay. So two bearings and a range, for example?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. Was the radar -- shifting to the Cosco Busan now,
- 11 was the radar on the Cosco Busan a radar that you had seen before,
- 12 that model?
- 13 A. It's different radars on different ships.
- 0. Okay. So this was the first time you had seen that
- 15 exact radar?
- 16 A. Yes, this is the first time that I've seen the radars on
- 17 the ships, and basically all radar has the same basic function.
- 18 O. Um-hum. Are you familiar with the different -- during
- 19 your time on the Cosco Busan, did you become familiar with all
- 20 modes of the radar, for example, parallel index lines,
- 21 navigational modes, ARPA, steering modes?
- 22 A. Yes, all the basic functions of the control.
- 23 And then, basically, when I came on board the Cosco
- 24 Busan, all these basic functions of the radars, I'm very familiar
- 25 with it, and as far as any function that need to be used, then I

- 1 can always refer to the manual.
- Q. You mentioned -- thank you. You mentioned that you had
- 3 tuned the radar on the day of November 7th, prior to the incident,
- 4 the allision?
- 5 A. Yes, it is correct.
- 6 Q. Can you describe, in detail, exactly how you tuned that
- 7 radar?
- 8 A. Okay, first of all, I do the tuning and then the BRM,
- 9 EBL. It is the electric bearing line.
- 10 Q. I know. Go ahead.
- 11 A. And ARPA.
- 12 Q. You tuned this radar by the pier, while the ship was
- 13 pier side?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Were there any obstructions pier side, like cranes or
- 16 anything like that close to the ship?
- 17 A. Yes, of course there were some cranes on the side of the
- 18 ship.
- 19 Q. Would that have any effect on tuning the radar?
- 20 A. I do not recall if there was any effect on tuning the
- 21 radar with the crane on the side, but in the past, there may be
- 22 some effect.
- 23 Q. I'm referring to a reflection of the radar signal off of
- 24 the crane.
- 25 A. I did not pay attention. I have only some experience

- 1 when we were on the open sea and the approaching ship, or any ship
- 2 passing by, with the crane on board. Then there was some
- 3 reflection.
- 4 Q. Okay. On the morning of the incident, 7 November, was
- 5 there -- do you recall any problems with picking up contacts,
- 6 radar contacts, away from the pier?
- 7 In other words, you were starboard side too. On the
- 8 port side of the ship, were there any problems?
- 9 A. As you know, when we were at the berth, the starboard
- 10 side was close to the shore and then the port side, I remember,
- 11 there was only one small ship passing by on that day.
- 12 Q. Was there a problem picking it up on the radar?
- 13 A. I did not pay much attention whether we can pick up any
- 14 target on the screen or not.
- 15 Q. Okay. I'd like to go back to your experience, your
- 16 total experience as third mate, in restricted waters going into
- 17 and out of port.
- 18 In your experience as third mate, in restricted waters,
- 19 when the pilot comes aboard the ship throughout the world, does
- 20 the pilot take control or con of the ship?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Can you recall, any time in your experience, when the
- 23 master of the vessel would con the ship in restricted waters?
- 24 That's with the pilot on board.
- 25 A. Yes, I have only one experience, one time that before we

- 1 get to the pilot station, why we are not yet entering the
- 2 restricted water and the weather -- I mean, it was very foggy and
- 3 there was some fog, not dense fog, some fog, then the water would
- 4 con the ship. I mean, the master would con the ship.
- 5 Q. Okay. But if I understand the answer to my question,
- 6 with the pilot on board, in restricted waters, the master would
- 7 not con the ship, from your experience?
- A. Yes, according to my experience, it is correct.
- 9 Q. Okay. Specifically back to the Cosco Busan, you were in
- 10 restricted waters, as I understand it, in three ports, Busan, Long
- 11 Beach and San Francisco, is that correct?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Were you on the bridge when the Cosco Busan departed
- 14 Busan?
- 15 A. Yes, I was.
- 16 Q. Who piloted the ship out of Busan? Who conned -- I'm
- 17 sorry. Who conned the ship? I'm looking for either the master or
- 18 the pilot.
- 19 A. The pilot.
- 20 Q. Okay. Coming into Long Beach, who conned the ship, the
- 21 master or the pilot?
- 22 A. You mean going into the restricted water?
- 23 O. Yes.
- A. Before or after the pilot station?
- Q. When the pilot came on board, going into restricted

- 1 waters, did the pilot con the ship, or the master?
- 2 A. The pilot, certainly.
- 3 Q. Okay. The same with leaving Long Beach?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. The same with coming into San Francisco?
- 6 A. It was the same.
- 7 Q. So normally, based on your experience, the pilot always
- 8 cons a ship once he's on board, is that correct?
- 9 A. Yes, according to my experience.
- 10 CAPT. HOLLY: That's all I have at this time. Thank you
- 11 very much.
- 12 BY CAPT. BROWN:
- 13 Q. Steve Brown of the American Pilots Association. Have
- 14 you ever been on a ship that called on a U.S. port, other than the
- 15 Cosco Busan?
- 16 A. Yes, I have experience coming to the American ports
- 17 while I was working as a cadet or --
- 18 Q. Were you on the bridge of the ship at any of those
- 19 times?
- 20 A. No, sir.
- Q. And you said, as a third mate, the ship you were on
- 22 called on Australia?
- 23 A. Yes, sir.
- Q. How many times?
- 25 A. Two or three times I went to Sydney, I believe.

- 1 Q. Sydney?
- 2 A. Brisbane and Sydney.
- 3 Q. Okay, thank you. A couple of things you mentioned
- 4 earlier, you said the pilot was on his cell phone after you left
- 5 the dock but before it hit the bridge?
- 6 A. Yes, he had used the cell phone.
- 7 Q. And can you remember where he was at? Was he walking
- 8 around?
- 9 A. I just have a memory that he used his cell phone on the
- 10 port side.
- 11 Q. Near the radar?
- 12 A. Yes, it seems to be that way.
- 13 Q. And do you recall it as only once or were there more
- 14 times?
- 15 A. At least one time, but I do not recall how many times.
- 16 Q. Thank you. While the pilot and the master were
- 17 conversing, talking, and after you left the berth, when you were
- 18 underway, did the master and the pilot go outside either the port
- 19 side or starboard side and talk?
- 20 A. First they were on the starboard side.
- Q. While leaving the berth?
- 22 A. And later on, they stand by in the middle of the bridge.
- Q. But did he notice them go outside and carry on a
- 24 conversation outside, after they left the dock?
- 25 A. I believe that they have gone outside and conversed with

- 1 each other, because, at that time, most of the time I was in the
- 2 middle of the bridge.
- 3 Q. And then I think we covered this, but I wanted to ask it
- 4 again. Can you recall, after the pilot came on board but before
- 5 you left the dock, the master and the pilot discussing red
- 6 triangles on the ECDIS?
- 7 A. Before the allision?
- 8 Q. No, I'm only talking about before you left the dock.
- 9 A. No, I did not notice. I do not know whether they have
- 10 discussed about it or not, or even if they have, I did not
- 11 understand their conversation.
- 12 CAPT. BROWN: Okay, that's all from me, for now.
- 13 BY CAPT. MOLONEY:
- Q. Hello, Patrick Moloney from the Pilot Commission. Which
- 15 sea watch did you stand?
- 16 A. The time?
- 17 O. Yes, the time.
- 18 A. Okay, 8:00 a.m. to 12:00.
- 19 Q. 8:00 to 12:00?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Yes, thank you. How much rest did you get before going
- 22 on watch November 7th?
- 23 A. I would estimate around five to six hours, because my
- 24 ship was off from 12:00 midnight to 0600 hours.
- Q. You said before, as the ship was going toward the

- 1 bridge, you stepped out on the bridgeway to look at the tug, but
- 2 you did not see it clearly.
- 3 Was that due to fog or containers blocking the view?
- 4 A. It was the fog.
- 5 Q. Thank you. After the accident, were you asked to alter
- 6 any ship's documents dealing with the ship's navigation?
- 7 A. We did not or I did not alter any document, but whatever
- 8 needed to be filled in, the forms that I need to fill, then I do
- 9 it. In particular, the checklist at the time, as I explained
- 10 earlier, that I have no time to check.
- But, then, after the incident, then I checkout the items
- 12 that I should have done.
- 13 Q. I understand, thank you. Did you make any changes to
- 14 the paper chart after the accident, any marks added or erased?
- 15 A. Yes, I did add.
- 16 Q. Can you tell me what you did?
- 17 A. I thought I have added two or three lines, but I do not
- 18 clearly recall which one.
- 19 Q. Did someone tell you to do it?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. If you were in a harbor and you are getting a navigation
- 22 fix using radar, how would you do it?
- 23 A. I do not normally use radar only, but yes, I would use
- 24 the radar and as well as the landmark and some other point.
- 25 Q. On the two fixes you took on November 7, did you use the

- 1 radar for either of those fixes?
- 2 A. Yes, there were fixes that I took. The first one is by
- 3 use of the radar and the second one, when our ship was almost
- 4 hitting the bridge span, then I make a quick mark on the chart to
- 5 estimate position that we were in.
- 6 CAPT. MOLONEY: I understand, thank you.
- 7 And for the record, I would like to say that I was
- 8 aboard the ship for the shift at Anchorage 9 to the shipyard and
- 9 Mr. Wang was kind enough to demonstrate how to use the radar for
- 10 me. It was clear to me that he knew what he was doing.
- 11 THE WITNESS: I appreciate that, sir.
- 12 CAPT. MOLONEY: That's all I have. Thank you.
- 13 BY CAPT. HURT:
- 0. Hi, Rick Hurt with the San Francisco Bar Pilots. What
- 15 license do you currently hold?
- 16 A. Yes, I hold two certifications. The first one was
- 17 certified by Hong Kong. That was for the third officer's
- 18 certificate. And, the one that's certified by Chinese authority,
- 19 in China, was the certificate for second officer.
- 20 O. Okay. And as well an STCW document?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And any endorsements on that STCW document?
- A. Can you explain?
- Q. Any qualifications on that STCW document?
- 25 A. Yes, basically, with the endorsement of the training

- 1 that I complete on radar, ARPA, and as well as GMD -- and other
- 2 small certificate.
- Q. Okay. You spoke of checklists earlier on, in
- 4 preparation for sailing. In your opinion, do these checklists
- 5 often ask for more work than can be accomplished?
- A. As far as I'm concerned, at that time, to prepare for
- 7 set sail, we would prepare, check equipment, rather than filling
- 8 those forms. Those forms are when we have time and after we
- 9 accomplish the chore, then we will fill in the checklist.
- 10 Q. Okay. Are there other tasks on board that were part of
- 11 your duties that required checklists?
- 12 A. Yes, there were some.
- Q. And did you -- were you able to -- did you generally
- 14 have enough time to accomplish those items on the checklists or
- 15 was there too much to do to meet the requirements of the
- 16 checklists?
- 17 A. As far as my experience is concerned, if I have to check
- 18 all those checklists and complete everything that is required of,
- 19 then we have no time to do other things.
- 20 Q. Okay. And finally, can you briefly describe your
- 21 understanding and purpose of the ship's Safety Management System,
- 22 or SMS?
- 23 A. Yes, I would say that I have a general idea of what's
- 24 required of the SMS.
- Q. Okay. Can you tell me, do you understand what the

- 1 purpose of the SMS is?
- 2 A. The purpose of SMS is safety, safety management on
- 3 board.
- 4 CAPT. HURT: Okay, that's all the questions I have.
- 5 Thank you.
- 6 BY MR. WHEATLEY:
- 7 Q. Good afternoon. I'm Ross Wheatley. I'm with the Coast
- 8 Guard. I just have a few questions, first about fixes and then a
- 9 little bit about the VTS.
- During the time that you were on the Cosco Busan, did
- 11 you have an opportunity to become familiar with or aware of the
- 12 frequency in which fixes needed to be taken while the vessel was
- 13 at sea?
- 14 A. I am not quite familiar with the frequencies, because,
- 15 basically, we were fresh from the Busan -- I mean from Busan to
- 16 Long Beach, Long Beach to open. We probably experienced two
- 17 ports.
- 18 Q. During the time that you were on board the Cosco Busan,
- 19 did you have an opportunity to become familiar with how often
- 20 fixes were required to be taken while the vessel was operating in
- 21 restricted waters?
- 22 A. According to the manual, of course, the shorter the
- 23 distance that I can take a fix, the better. But in reality or in
- 24 practical, that we were overwhelmed with other chores or other
- 25 operations, it is impossible to do.

- 1 When we were in the restricted water and -- my main
- 2 concern or main duty was to control the engine room telegraph and
- 3 -- as well as the bow thruster.
- 4 Q. On the day of the accident, you previously stated that
- 5 you took two fixes, one just before you left the dock and one just
- 6 before you hit the bridge. Can you estimate what the time
- 7 interval was between those two fixes?
- 8 A. Approximately, half an hour.
- 9 Q. After he took the two fixes, did he share any of the
- 10 information concerning those with the master?
- 11 A. No, because the reason is that, on board the ships, the
- 12 electronic chart systems, it will automatically plot the position
- 13 or plotting the position of the ship automatically. You can set
- 14 on the electronic chart systems, on the frequency, whether it is
- 15 five minutes, 10 minutes, 20 minutes, or maybe half an hour.
- 16 Q. Does he recall what the frequency was set for on the day
- 17 of the accident?
- 18 A. I did set it, you know, in the beginning, but I don't
- 19 know, after that, whether there were any other person did anything
- 20 to it or not. I believe that there is -- there was records in
- 21 that setting. Yes, in the electronic chart, there has to be a
- 22 recording. Yes, if I ever set any settings on the electronic
- 23 chart system, you will find that out in the record.
- Q. Okay. Did you ever share any of the information
- 25 concerning the two fixes you plotted on the paper chart, with the

- 1 pilot?
- 2 A. No, sir.
- Q. Why not?
- 4 A. At the time, I thought it was unnecessary.
- 5 O. During the day of the accident, did you talk on the
- 6 radio with the Vessel Traffic Service?
- 7 A. As far as I remember, I did not. I do not believe that
- 8 I have talked to VTS before the accident, but there might be one
- 9 time after the accident.
- 10 MR. WHEATLEY: Thank you. I have no further questions.
- 11 MR. HENRY: Captain Aga, this is Rob Henry. Do you have
- 12 any questions?
- 13 CAPT. AGA: Yes, Mr. Henry, I have a few questions.
- 14 So can I start?
- MR. HENRY: Yes, please proceed.
- 16 BY CAPT. AGA:
- 17 Q. Okay, Mr. Wang, my name is Captain Aga. I am asking you
- 18 questions over the telephone and I apologize, I cannot be there.
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. My first question is, when the U.S. Coast Guard
- 21 came on board after the allision and interviewed you on the ship
- 22 the first time, did they use an interpreter?
- 23 A. I remember that one of the Coast Guard that interviewed
- 24 me, speak some Chinese, but I do not believe that they made use of
- 25 a professional interpreter, because the person that asked me was

- 1 in Coast Guard uniform.
- Q. Okay. Was that the first time they came on board or was
- 3 it the second time they came on board?
- 4 A. That was not the first time. I only remember, it could
- 5 be the second or maybe the third time that the Coast Guard went on
- 6 board. That was around 10:00 a.m. I do not recall when was the
- 7 first time [sic].
- 8 Q. Okay, the next question. Did you -- can you tell me if
- 9 the job as the third mate on the other ship is any different from
- 10 the job as the third mate on the Cosco Busan?
- 11 A. Basically, the function or the duties of the third mate,
- 12 as third mate on Cosco Busan and with -- or with other ships that
- 13 I worked on, basically were the same.
- But then, different ships has a different -- has
- 15 something in difference that we have to learn or to follow.
- 16 Q. It's different. Is it -- or is it -- how different is
- 17 the difference?
- 18 A. Yes, let me tell you my experience, when I worked as a
- 19 cadet and I learned that the third officer would be on the bridge
- 20 and then the chief officer was stationed on the bow and the second
- 21 officer was stationed in the stern.
- But then, on the ship that I worked as a cadet, but then
- 23 the chief mate would be on the bridge. And then, of course, the
- 24 second officer was stationed on the bow and then the third officer
- 25 will be on the stern.

- 1 So I just want to pick out some examples that there were
- 2 such differences on the Cosco Busan and other ships.
- 3 Q. Okay, basically the organization on board the ship was
- 4 different, but the job isn't, correct?
- 5 A. Yes, basic duties were the same. Basic duties were the
- 6 same, but then, if you were stationed in different area or
- 7 position of the ships, then the duties were different.
- 8 Q. In your experience, how many times a pilot has asked you
- 9 to take a fix?
- 10 A. Yes, there were some occasions, but not many.
- 11 Q. How many?
- 12 A. Seldom. Yes, I remember that when I was in Japan,
- 13 sometimes in Japan they'll ask me. Even the pilot himself would
- 14 take a fix.
- 15 Q. Okay, in restricted waters, is the pilot following the
- 16 course on your chart or he follows it on course, in your
- 17 experience?
- 18 A. According to my experience, the pilot would follow his
- 19 own courses.
- Q. Okay, the next question about the fix. If, on the Cosco
- 21 Busan, you were to use a GPS to take a fix, where was the GPS
- 22 printed on the Cosco Busan, was it on the chart paper?
- 23 A. That was correct, it was right in front.
- Q. Okay. So if you were to use the GPS, you would just
- 25 look up and take a position and put it directly on the chart and

- 1 not try to memorize it, correct?
- A. Sometimes I do not use the GPS, but I use the radar.
- 3 But then, as you see that there was some data for the GPS on the
- 4 radar, correct.
- 5 Q. Okay. My next question about the chart -- you were
- 6 asked about marking on the paper chart. Do you regularly erase
- 7 markings on the paper chart and all markings are made by pencil?
- 8 This is a common practice, correct?
- 9 A. Yes, the only times that I erase in any respect or any
- 10 line that I would have made and I thought it was a mistake. Then
- 11 I would use the eraser.
- But then, sometimes we have only one chart, one paper
- 13 chart, so if we were supposed to be on a different voyage, I would
- 14 erase the course, the former course on the chart. I would erase
- 15 the fix.
- 16 THE INTERPRETER: I'm sorry, the interpreter made a
- 17 mistake.
- 18 THE WITNESS: And the reason that we erase the fix for
- 19 the next voyage is just to make sure that there were -- the fix
- 20 that we used before were completely off the chart.
- 21 BY CAPT. AGA:
- 22 Q. Okay. And my next question. When you joined the Cosco
- 23 Busan, you have a license to be a second officer from the
- 24 government of China. Did you need to be trained on how to be a
- 25 third officer when you joined the Cosco Busan?

- 1 A. Yes, I held the second officer's license in China when I
- 2 was hired to work as a third officer, third mate, in the Cosco
- 3 Busan.
- 4 And your question is, do I need extra training? Yes, I
- 5 would need extra training because the license only allows me to
- 6 have the knowledge of basic duty as the second or third mate, but
- 7 each ship has a different -- each ship was different, so I do need
- 8 extra training. The licenses only show that you have the basic
- 9 knowledge. It means, if you were issued a driver's license, it
- 10 doesn't mean you can drive any kind of motor vehicle.
- 11 Q. Okay, understood. So what kind of training would have
- 12 been given to you to make you third officer on this ship?
- 13 A. Well, the additional training was supposed to be
- 14 arranged by the captain or the Fleet Management or the company
- 15 itself.
- 16 Q. So, in his experience, what kind of training would he
- 17 have required, because he was a third officer on the previous ship
- 18 also?
- 19 A. I cannot say what additional training that I would have
- 20 benefit from, but rather, I would follow or obeyed the arrangement
- 21 of the Fleet company -- Fleet Management Company.
- 22 Q. Okay. We talked about what -- next question -- we
- 23 talked about communication with the engine room when the pilot was
- 24 onboard. Did he use the telephone to call the engine room from
- 25 the bridge on the day of the allision before the men had left the

- 1 dock?
- 2 A. I believe that I have, but I do not remember clearly.
- 3 Q. If the telegraph work properly on that day?
- 4 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay.
- 6 CAPT. AGA: I have no further questions at this point,
- 7 Mr. Henry. I just would like the witness to look at -- and mark
- 8 that -- and confirm that the copy that is there with Mr. Greenberg
- 9 is an accurate one, if that is allowed.
- 10 MR. HENRY: You can mark that as the next exhibit in
- 11 line.
- 12 (Whereupon, the document referred to
- 13 as NTSB Exhibit 11 was
- marked for identification.)
- 15 THE WITNESS: Which page would you like to see?
- 16 MR. HENRY: It should be a three page copy.
- 17 THE WITNESS: One by one? Or you want to see --
- 18 MR. HENRY: There are a few originals. Just make sure
- 19 it's an accurate copy of your --
- 20 THE WITNESS: Seaman Book --
- MR. HENRY: We have a good copy. What's the next in
- 22 line, eleven?
- 23 If you can just compare your copy to the original and
- 24 just confirm that the copy is an accurate copy?
- 25 THE WITNESS: Yes. It is the same.

- 1 MR. HENRY: Captain Aga, anything else?
- 2 CAPT. AGA: No. There is nothing at the moment. Thank
- 3 you.
- 4 MR. COMBS: Let's go off the record.
- 5 COURT REPORTER: Off the record.
- 6 (Off the record.)
- 7 (On the record.)
- 8 MR. HENRY: The master will not be available until 8:30
- 9 tomorrow morning, so we will start at 8:30 sharp and the intention
- 10 is unless we see this thing becoming very protracted, to complete
- 11 it tomorrow and he's willing to go as late as it has to be to get
- 12 it done.
- If we see it just really dragging on and we have to go
- 14 to Friday, we'll make that decision, but at this point we're going
- 15 to try and complete it tomorrow.
- 16 MR. STRAUCH: Will the people be willing to work through
- 17 lunch tomorrow to facilitate that?
- 18 MR. HENRY: Well, I think we're going to need -- because
- 19 this is a stressful situation for the individuals -- back on the
- 20 record. We're on the record.
- 21 Captain Jones has the next round of questions.
- 22 BY CAPTAIN JONES:
- 23 Q. Okay, Mr. Wang. Thanks again. Have you had experience
- 24 with an electronic chart before the Cosco Busan?
- 25 A. Yes, I have the experience when I worked as a cadet on

- 1 some of the ships.
- Q. Okay. And did you feel you were comfortable using the
- 3 equipment in the basic operation?
- 4 A. Yes, that is correct. Basic operation --
- 5 Q. Okay. Did you notice anything wrong with the radar once
- 6 the vessel left the dock prior to the allision?
- 7 A. No problems. I don't think there was any.
- Q. Okay, I just want to clarify that. You asked him about
- 9 the radars, both radars, not the electronic chart, but the radars?
- 10 A. That is correct.
- 11 Q. Okay. Did the master comment that there was anything
- 12 wrong with either of the radars after you left the dock until the
- 13 time you hit -- the allision?
- 14 A. I didn't hear any comments from the master.
- 15 Q. Okay. And how about the pilot, did the pilot comment on
- 16 anything wrong with the radars?
- 17 A. After leaving the berth?
- 18 Q. That's correct, after leaving the berth, after you did
- 19 all the tuning originally, once you got under way, was there any
- 20 comment from the pilot about the radars prior to the allision?
- 21 A. I did not hear any comment from -- and as far as I'm
- 22 concerned, I didn't hear anything from him, but I do not know if
- 23 the pilot had ever discussed with the master in the regard of the
- 24 radars.
- Q. Okay, thank you. How's your ability with the radars,

- 1 the basic operation? Are you confident in that?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. Do you know the second mate that was onboard, was
- 4 he maybe better with the radars than you were or the electronic
- 5 equipment, the electronic chart and the radars?
- 6 A. As far as I'm concerned, he should be more experienced
- 7 than I because he work as navigation officer and furthermore, he
- 8 is in charge of this equipment. Just as, you know, I am familiar
- 9 with the firefighting equipment, myself.
- 10 Q. Okay. And I apologize. I shouldn't have said better, I
- 11 should've said more experienced. Okay. And on the electronic
- 12 chart that morning, while underway, was there a course line drawn
- 13 on the electronic chart?
- 14 A. Yes, it was imported in.
- 15 Q. Yes, it was?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Okay. Now, in all the American ports that you've been
- 18 in while you were on the bridge, did you have any problem
- 19 understanding the pilot's orders in English?
- 20 A. Normally, I would understand the pilot pretty well if he
- 21 speaks slowly, but most of the time, if they speak quickly, then I
- 22 would have a little difficulty in understanding them.
- Q. And what do you do if you have difficulty?
- 24 A. If I have difficulty when converse with the pilot, I
- 25 will look at the captain for help.

- 1 Q. Would you talk to the pilot and just ask him to speak
- 2 slowly?
- 3 A. Yes. And sometime I use gesture, as well.
- 4 Q. Okay. When -- we were talking about SMS before. Have
- 5 you ever been through an SMS audit?
- 6 A. I think that I have experience once, but I do not -- I
- 7 only knew that it was an internal audit.
- 8 Q. Okay. When you go through the audit or when you're on
- 9 the ship, has anyone from the company or the captain or the safety
- 10 officer, which you said was the chief engineer, stressed how
- 11 important it is to follow the SMS procedures?
- 12 A. Ordinarily, we would have a Monday meeting for the
- 13 safety on board, safety measure on board, and then every week we
- 14 have a drill, safety drill, on board, as well.
- 15 Q. Okay, I'm specifically talking to the procedures. Now
- 16 there were two Fleet company personnel on board for two weeks and
- 17 in those two weeks, crossing the ocean, before San Francisco. Did
- 18 they emphasize to learn the SMS?
- 19 A. During the two weeks' period of time that the two
- 20 superintendent were on board, we are on the new ship, new company,
- 21 new procedures and there was so many other things to learn and of
- 22 course, we will come to ask question if we ever have with the
- 23 superintendent or he occasionally will come along and then tell us
- 24 what to do.
- Q. Okay. Let's just go back to plotting fixes for one

- 1 minute, all right? When you're at sea, open ocean, how often do
- 2 you take fixes -- plot a fix?
- 3 A. One fix every hour.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- A. And sometimes we have one fix during two hours' period
- 6 of time --
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. -- if we were busy on open sea.
- 9 Q. And you're the officer of the watch, you have the con,
- 10 you plot your fix, you're off a little bit, little bit north, a
- 11 little bit south. What do you do?
- 12 A. On the open sea, while I was the only one who was on the
- 13 bridge, if we were off course a little bit and we take a fix, then
- 14 probably I wouldn't do anything, but if we are too much off
- 15 course, then we will try to correct.
- 16 Q. So you adjust course?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. Your pilotage orders, how often do you take a
- 19 fix? There's a pilot on board; the master's on board, pilot's at
- 20 the con, how often do you take a fix?
- 21 A. Nobody would tell me the frequency of taking fix in the
- 22 restricted water.
- 23 Q. Okay. If he can answer this, would this be fair to say,
- 24 you take a fix when you can take a fix?
- 25 A. That is correct. I can say so.

- 1 Q. Okay. If you were off course, would you adjust the
- 2 course?
- A. It is a normal thing to be off course a little bit in
- 4 the restricted water. When we were on the restricted water, if we
- 5 were on the port for the very first time, basically the pilot will
- 6 guide us, will depend upon the weather condition, depend upon the
- 7 draft and also the traffic in the restricted water and the current
- 8 condition.
- 9 Q. Okay. I think we talked about this before, but just for
- 10 -- has a pilot ever asked you for -- to plot a fix?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Have you ever, after plotting a fix, gone up and told
- 13 the pilot where you were or where the fix showed you were?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 CAPTAIN JONES: Okay. All right, thank you.
- 16 BY MR. HENRY:
- 17 Q. Robert Henry, NTSB. Mr. Wang, do you know why the
- 18 vessel's departure was delayed?
- 19 A. You know, the reason that the ship was delayed, because
- 20 we were waiting for the two superintendents to disembark and other
- 21 than that, I do not know other reason.
- 22 Q. Mr. Wang, are you aware that the captain was frustrated
- 23 because the superintendents had not left the vessel?
- 24 A. I think that there was some upset.
- 25 Q. Mr. Wang, you said that the captain would repeat the

- 1 commands from the pilot, is that correct?
- 2 A. That is correct.
- Q. Did he do this all the time or most of the time or some
- 4 of the time?
- 5 A. Some time.
- 6 Q. Did he do this for both helm commands and throttle
- 7 commands?
- 8 A. Sometime the pilot was out there on the bridge wing and
- 9 we were inside and of course, the captain will repeat the command.
- 10 Q. Were these commands that the captain repeated, were they
- 11 in English or in Chinese?
- 12 A. English.
- Q. Did you or the helmsman wait for the captain to repeat
- 14 the command?
- 15 A. It depends on where the pilot was. If the pilot was
- 16 outside the bridge, then we can hardly hear his command. The
- 17 captain would repeat the command louder, but then if the pilot was
- 18 inside the bridge and certainly we can hear him well, we do not
- 19 need the captain to repeat the commands.
- 20 Q. Did the captain repeat commands from the pilots that
- 21 were used when the vessel entered and departed from Long Beach?
- 22 A. Sometime, yes.
- 23 Q. And the same on -- with the pilot coming in to Oakland?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. When you heard the pilot give a command, was his

- 1 pronunciation, was his speech, clear?
- 2 MR. STRAUCH: Rob, which pilot are you talking about
- 3 now? You touched on Long Beach --
- 4 MR. HENRY: This is the pilot leaving Oakland.
- 5 THE WITNESS: He spoke clearly and of course, the
- 6 commands that we listen to it hundreds of times, so I have no
- 7 problems understand.
- 8 BY MR. HENRY:
- 9 Q. When was the last command given to you for working the
- 10 -- thruster? When and where was the vessel?
- 11 A. I do not recall clearly.
- 12 Q. What was the last engine order telegraph command?
- 13 A. I think that was when we were anchoring.
- 0. I'm sorry -- prior to the allision -- my mistake.
- 15 A. Okay. I was still operating the telegraph before the
- 16 allision?
- 17 Q. Yes. And what was the last engine order telegraph
- 18 command prior to the allision, from the pilot?
- 19 A. I think there have got to be some record, but I do not
- 20 recall clearly when was the last time.
- Q. Just before the bow reported the bridge directly ahead,
- 22 Mr. Wang, do you know how close the vessel was to the bridge at
- 23 that time?
- A. I could not see clearly, even for those who were in the
- 25 bow would have a difficult time to observe.

- 1 Q. But not by sight, but by position of the vessel, by
- 2 radar or by electronic chart, did he have an idea of how close the
- 3 vessel was to the bridge?
- 4 A. At that time I was so concerned to look, I -- rather
- 5 than looking at the radar at times.
- Q. Mr. Wang, do you know how fast the vessel was going when
- 7 it allided with the bridge?
- 8 A. I did not pay attention on the speed.
- 9 Q. The superintendent from Fleet Management that worked
- 10 with you, was that Captain Singh?
- 11 A. Yes, on the deck.
- 12 Q. Did Captain Singh teach you or talk to you and the crew
- 13 about what to expect on coming to the U.S. and Coast Guard port
- 14 state inspection that would happen?
- 15 A. Yes, they give us some lecture on that.
- 16 Q. Did Captain Singh talk to you about how to work with
- 17 U.S. pilots, what to expect, how to act?
- 18 A. No, I don't think so.
- 19 Q. Mr. Wang, are you going to continue to pursue your
- 20 mariner career?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Why do you believe the accident happened?
- 23 A. I don't want to think about it.
- Q. No feel for the cause of the accident?
- 25 A. You know, when I thought about it, I have a headache, so

- 1 I learn not to think about it.
- MR. STRAUCH: We all feel the same way, I think.
- MR. HENRY: Thank you, Mr. Wang. Dr. Strauch.
- 4 BY MR. STRAUCH:
- 5 Q. Barry Strauch from the NTSB. So you're not going to
- 6 continue sailing after this accident?
- 7 A. Yes, of course I wanted to change my career. And
- 8 furthermore, I will have a very difficult time to find a job on
- 9 the same -- I mean, on the shipping industry.
- 10 Q. Why are you leaving the marine industry?
- 11 A. You know, working as a seaman, crew member, on board the
- 12 ships -- I work very hard. I think it is a hard line.
- 13 Q. You worked for Fleet Management on another vessel before
- 14 you worked on the Cosco Busan. How much time was there between
- 15 the time you left the first Fleet Management vessel and the time
- 16 you got -- you boarded the Cosco Busan?
- 17 A. Yes, I was onshore for five months, approximately.
- 18 Q. And what did you do during those five months?
- 19 A. My back hurt on the previous ship, so I think that I
- 20 need to take a rest and then have the doctors look at it, to treat
- 21 me.
- Q. And did the doctors do that?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Did you need the doctors to certify you that you're
- 25 medically fit to board a ship again?

- 1 A. I was on board, I hurt my back and then normally, there
- 2 was no doctor on board and then it takes four or five days before
- 3 we have a dock call. Yes, four to five days -- forty-five days.
- 4 Yes, sometime 45 days before we can see the doctors again and then
- 5 again, I hurt my back.
- 6 Q. Okay. You worked for two other companies in addition to
- 7 Fleet Management, is that correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And how would you compare how well Fleet Management
- 10 prepared you to serve on the Cosco Busan compared to how well the
- 11 other companies prepared you to serve on their vessel?
- 12 A. I do not think about -- make the comparison between the
- 13 companies, between the preparations or trainings to work for a
- 14 certain company because we were busy learning things onboard, if
- 15 we had time --
- 16 A. Yes, on all the vessels.
- 17 Q. How many years did you study English?
- 18 A. I learn English when I was in junior high and we don't
- 19 have the opportunity to converse in English. Only after going up
- 20 on board the ship, working on board the ship, then I would
- 21 practice my English.
- 22 Q. Did you learn English, also, at the Maritime Academy in
- 23 Wuhan?
- 24 A. Yes, terminology and again, terminology is what I
- 25 learned rather than having opportunity to converse.

- 1 Q. Can you tell us how many years of English you studied in
- 2 school?
- 3 A. Four years. Four years and then of course, here and
- 4 there I learn some English, too.
- 5 Q. Now, let's go back to the day of the accident. Let's go
- 6 back to the day of the accident. Okay. The pilot got on the
- 7 vessel and then there was a delay before you departed, is that
- 8 correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. I believe there was a delay of at least an hour or more?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Did you have a chance to talk to the pilot in that time?
- 13 A. My English wasn't that good, but then while the pilot
- 14 was on board, the captain was talking to him. And sometimes I
- 15 don't know what to say to the pilot because of my limited English.
- 16 Q. Did the captain seem to have difficulty conversing with
- 17 the pilot, as well?
- 18 A. And of course, I thought that the captain's English is
- 19 much better than mine.
- Q. Do you didn't observe the captain have any difficulty
- 21 communicating with the pilot, is that correct?
- 22 A. Sometimes the captain can speak in a -- manner. He
- 23 spoke very fast and I don't understand him, either.
- Q. This was in English the captain spoke?
- 25 A. Yes, in English.

- 1 Q. Okay. Do you remember any of the discussions between
- 2 the captain and the pilot?
- 3 A. I just overheard something in regard to that the ship
- 4 has to wait until the two superintendents disembark and then the
- 5 time for set sail.
- 6 Q. How did the pilot seem to you that morning?
- 7 A. Nothing particular.
- 8 Q. How many different captains have you served under?
- 9 A. I've been serving on five ships and I believe that I
- 10 have served under six, approximately six captain, six or seven.
- 11 Q. During the passage from the dock up to the time of the
- 12 accident, was there anything different in the way the captain
- 13 monitored the pilot and the voyage about this captain compared to
- 14 the other captains you have served under?
- 15 A. The only question that I have is that -- was that the
- 16 captain spoke better English and please understand that I was
- 17 working with him, under him, with this captain for very short
- 18 period of times, probably two ports, so I have no idea.
- 19 Q. Okay. And when you say the captain spoke better
- 20 English, are you saying he spoke better English than the other
- 21 five captains you served under?
- 22 A. Yes, I compare with other captains.
- MR. STRAUCH: Okay. Thank you very much. I have no
- 24 further questions.
- MR. HENRY: Captain Holly.

- 1 BY CAPTAIN HOLLY:
- Q. Rick Holly here, Department of Fish and Game, OSPR. I
- 3 have some questions regarding the electronic chart.
- 4 Specifically, on the proposed track going into and out
- 5 of port, departing Pusan, from previous testimony, you were on the
- 6 bridge as third mate and in that capacity, did you see input to
- 7 the electronic chart the proposed track, the proposed track on the
- 8 electronic chart?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Same question for entering Long Beach, was the proposed
- 11 track on the electronic chart?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And exiting Long Beach?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Coming in to San Francisco?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Okay. And then I just want to understand that I
- 18 understood correctly, Captain Jones asked if the proposed track
- 19 exiting San Francisco was on the electronic chart?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 CAPTAIN HOLLY: Okay, thank you. That's all I have.
- 22 BY CAPTAIN BROWN:
- 23 Q. I don't know what to say. I thought I saw picture of
- 24 ECDIS. I didn't see the proposed track.
- 25 A. The one that you have seen is from pilot to pilot. What

- 1 you have seen was pilot to pilot, but from berth to pilot station,
- 2 you wouldn't see, would be able --
- 3 Q. There's no proposed track from berth to pilot?
- 4 A. That was correct.
- 5 O. And the same for Long Beach, same for Pusan?
- 6 A. Yes. Yes, I don't think there is any.
- 7 Q. But the ECDIS does a trail, a track? Electronic chart.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Shows where you were, not where you're going. On that
- 10 track, it also left a mark every five minutes, is that correct?
- 11 A. You can set five, ten minutes or any duration --
- 12 Q. In this case it was set for five, correct? Here's the
- 13 picture.
- 14 A. I do not recall clearly.
- 15 Q. See if that refreshes his recollection. Five minute
- 16 mark.
- 17 A. Yes, five minute.
- 18 Q. I want to -- the image for the record. It's VMS 0757 of
- 19 the NTSB public document. To change the subject, then. When
- 20 you're departing, your fog signal was on?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Did you hear any other fog signals?
- 23 A. I did not pay attention, but maybe I heard some.
- Q. And do you recall, as you got closer to the bridge, did
- 25 you hear any fog signal?

- 1 A. I do not recall clearly.
- 2 CAPTAIN BROWN: That's all for me, thank you. I didn't
- 3 identify myself.
- 4 MR. HENRY: Thank you, Captain Brown.
- 5 BY MR. MALONEY:
- 6 Q. Patrick Maloney from the Pilot Commission. Ship system
- 7 training would've been useful at the turnover from the previous
- 8 crew, but it was not provided. Would it have made any difference
- 9 in this incident if it had been provided?
- 10 A. As far as I'm concerned, a little bit more training is
- 11 better.
- 12 Q. But would it have made any difference on this occasion?
- 13 Just an opinion.
- 14 A. It is very hard for me to explain because this is the
- 15 only time and the first time.
- 16 Q. Thank you. You testified that the bosun called on the
- 17 walkie-talkie to report seeing the bridge tower. Where was the
- 18 chief mate at the time?
- 19 A. I do not recall.
- 20 Q. When the bosun called in and reported the tower, you
- 21 hurried to take and plot a fix. Could you go through each step
- 22 from when you left the engine order telegraph to taking the fix,
- 23 plotting it, and returning to the telegraph, how much time did it
- 24 take?
- 25 A. Basically, to my estimate, it takes roughly ten second

- 1 because I did take a very good look at the GPS in order to take a
- 2 fix on them and then run back to the telegraph.
- Q. While you were doing the fix, did the pilot give any
- 4 orders to the helm?
- 5 A. I don't think that he order or not. I only overheard
- 6 the captain that I got it, I got it.
- 7 Q. Do you remember if there were any engine orders given
- 8 while you were taking the fix?
- 9 A. No engine orders.
- 10 Q. Thank you. Was your ability to read English good enough
- 11 so that you could understand the Fleet Management manuals and the
- 12 technical manuals?
- 13 A. This is what I did, I understand most of it. Anything
- 14 that I have a difficult in understanding, I can always refer to my
- 15 dictionary or asking somebody else.
- 16 Q. Were the ship's manuals that you were expected to read
- 17 all in English or were there some in Chinese?
- 18 A. All the manuals were in English.
- 19 Q. You mentioned that there was training provided on a DVD.
- 20 Was that in English or Chinese?
- 21 A. You mean when we were leaving Beijing?
- 22 Q. Yes.
- 23 A. In Chinese.
- Q. And did you understand everything in the training DVD?
- 25 A. Yes, I believe that I understood because the DVD

- 1 training were involving the firefighting and man overboard drill,
- 2 et cetera.
- 3 MR. MALONEY: All right, that's all I have. Thank you.
- 4 BY MR. HURT:
- Q. Rick Hurt, San Francisco Bar Pilots. Alongside the dock
- 6 -- I think this has been answered, but it bears repeating --
- 7 alongside the dock prior to sailing, do you recall any
- 8 conversation that you could understand between the captain and the
- 9 pilot regarding sailing in the existing visibility?
- 10 A. I could not recall. I do not recall their conversation
- 11 or overheard their conversation, but one thing that I put in my
- 12 mind was their conversation regarding the disembarkment of the two
- 13 superintendent.
- 0. Okay. Do you recall any conversation between the
- 15 captain and any other deck officer on the bridge with regard to
- 16 sailing in the existing visibility?
- 17 A. I do not believe that I overheard because the captain
- 18 was outside the bridge on the bridge wing and I can hardly hear
- 19 him. He might say something to the chief officer or somebody on
- 20 the deck. And then I partly remembered that captain did say
- 21 something about the radar with second officer.
- 22 MR. HURT: Okay, thank you. I have nothing else.
- MR. WHEATLEY: Ross Wheatley with the Coast Guard. I
- 24 have no further questions.
- MR. HENRY: Captain Aga, this is Robert Henry. Do you

- 1 have any questions on the second round?
- 2 CAPTAIN AGA: Yes, I have a just a couple of questions.
- 3 Can I go ahead?
- 4 MR. HENRY: Yes, sir.
- 5 BY CAPTAIN AGA:
- 6 Q. Okay, Mr. Wang, the superintendent, Captain Singh, was
- 7 he on the bridge when the ship came in to Long Beach?
- 8 A. I do not recall clearly.
- 9 Q. Was he on the bridge when the ship departed Long Beach?
- 10 A. Again, I do not recall if he were on the bridge or not,
- 11 but I remember he were on the bridge when we departed from Pusan.
- 12 Q. Okay. For the San Francisco arrival, does he remember
- 13 whether he was on the bridge again, just for the record?
- 14 A. I do not have an impression or any recollection that he
- 15 was on the bridge.
- 16 Q. Okay. You said that from the last ship you disembarked
- 17 with a back injury. Did you need a medical certificate before you
- 18 could come back?
- 19 A. As you know, that every ship that I service on before
- 20 that, I have to have a health checkup. Yes, I have a medical
- 21 record indicate that I'm qualified to go onboard, to work on
- 22 board.
- Q. Okay, follow-up question. Because of the injury, did
- 24 you undergo a treatment and who paid for the treatment?
- 25 A. You know, my injury occurred when I was working as an OS

- 1 long time ago, but then it reoccurred, I mean, I have hurt myself
- 2 again and I believe that my medical treatment was paid for by the
- 3 company.
- 4 Q. Okay. Which was that company?
- 5 A. I think that the company's name is Marlowe, while they
- 6 were merging two company together at that time.
- 7 Q. Okay. Now, between the first ship with Fleet Management
- 8 and the Cosco Busan, you had a gap of five months and you said you
- 9 underwent treatment. Did you do the treatment by yourself, then?
- 10 A. I paid for my treatment during that period of time.
- 11 Q. Okay. That means Fleet Management was not aware that
- 12 you were injured?
- 13 A. This is what happened. I feel the pain again while
- 14 working on the ship and what I did was just apply some ointment
- 15 and after I get off that ship, going onshore for the five months,
- 16 I went to see the doctor, so I don't think the company was aware.
- 17 Q. Okay, thank you. One last question.
- 18 Are you normally respectful to your peers, including
- 19 pilots? Is it important to be respectful?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 CAPTAIN AGA: Okay. Thank you very much, Mr. Wang.
- I have no further questions, Mr. Henry.
- MR. HENRY: Thank you, Captain Aga. This completes the
- 24 second round of questioning and the interviewing of Mr. Wang
- 25 unless I hear anybody that has a question for which they feel they

1	have to ask before we adjourn?
2	(No response.)
3	MR. HENRY: Hearing none, you may go off the record.
4	(Whereupon, the interview in the above-entitled matter
5	was concluded.)
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the attached proceeding before the

NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF: M/V COSCO BUSAN/BRIDGE ALLISION

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA Interview of Hong Zhi Wang

DOCKET NUMBER: DCA-08-MM-004

PLACE: San Francisco, California

DATE: December 3, 2008

was held according to the record, and that this is the original, complete, true and accurate transcript which has been compared to the recording accomplished at the hearing.

Sussy Morehouse

Reporter

David Martini Transcriber